

DATE: January 29, 2015**SUBJECT:** Academic Program Review**ACTION RECOMMENDED:** Information

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: As Tennessee's institutions of higher education continue to focus on the goals of completion and student success, there is a clear need for an ongoing evaluation of the state's academic programs. Recent years have seen a period of extensive growth in the current academic program inventory coupled with the concerns that a significant number of programs are failing to meet productivity thresholds. In January 2014, THEC notified the Tennessee Board of Regents and the University of Tennessee of a 12-month moratorium on new academic programs beginning July 2014. This six-month period allowed the governing boards to submit program proposals that were currently being developed by faculty and administrators to the THEC staff for evaluation.

The moratorium allowed THEC to work jointly with each system to assess the health of academic offerings, make necessary adjustments to academic program policy, and ensure that all programs are fully aligned for student success. As the state continues to move toward 55 percent of Tennesseans obtaining a college degree or certificate by 2025, it is vital that our institutions of higher education provide students with high quality academic programs.

The Academic Program Review provides a holistic view of the status of degree programs throughout the state, and includes the following components:

- **Program Activity:** Depicts new programs added to the state inventory in 2014, as well as programs that have been terminated.
- **Post Approval Monitoring:** Assesses success of new programs approved within the last five years against projected enrollment and graduation benchmarks.
- **Performance Funding Qualitative Reviews:** Results of accreditation reviews, consultant evaluations, or academic audits of established programs as a Performance Funding qualitative measure.
- **Program Productivity Review:** On-going monitoring of all programs in operation for more than five years is conducted to identify those that are not graduating a sufficient number of students as well as those programs that are thriving.

1) Program Activity

The Commission has the statutory responsibility to review and approve new academic programs, while responsibility for program termination lies with the two governing boards. However, Commission staff may recommend termination to the TBR and UT systems.

During 2014, the Commission approved seven programs and the Board of Regents approved 27 pre-baccalaureate programs. The governing boards terminated 15 programs.

A complete listing of program approvals and terminations can be found in Appendix A.

Table 1: New Programs and Terminations, 2014

| | New Programs | Terminations | Net Change |
|------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| TBR Universities | 7 | 3 | 4 |
| UT System | 0 | 3 | -3 |
| TBR Community Colleges | 27 | 9 | 18 |
| Total Actions | 34 | 15 | 19 |

- Of the 34 new programs, the majority were certificate and associate degree programs approved by the Board of Regents.
- Program approval activity for 2014 remained stable in comparison to 2013. During 2013, there were 37 new program approvals with two new programs approved for the UT System.
- THEC approved four graduate programs and three programs at the baccalaureate level. Each of these programs was approved under the more rigorous program approval process instituted in 2011 and is congruent with the institutional mission profile.
- Overall termination activity was high in comparison to programs terminated in 2013. Termination activity consisted of three bachelor's programs and three graduate programs at the public universities. During 2013, only five programs were terminated.

2) Post Approval Monitoring

Newly approved programs are evaluated under the Post Approval Monitoring (PAM) cycle for five years at the baccalaureate level and above and three years for pre-baccalaureate programs. Effective with the revised academic policy, doctoral programs will be monitored for a seven-year period. This review evaluates programs against enrollment and graduate projections, program cost, and other goals agreed upon by the governing boards and THEC.

Benchmarks for programs are developed by each institution and failure to meet these benchmarks can impact the institution substantially. For example, if the institution does not enroll the projected number of students then there may be a deficit in tuition receipts, and thus, a financial burden to the institution.

THEC can recommend termination for those programs that do not, over the monitoring period, show improvement.

Table 2: Summary of Post Approval Monitoring

| | Programs Meeting Benchmarks | Programs Not Meeting Benchmarks | Delayed Programs |
|------------------------|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------|
| TBR Universities | 11 | 15 | -- |
| UT System | 3 | 3 | 1 |
| TBR Community Colleges | 6 | 19 | 3 |
| Total | 20 | 37 | 4 |

The full summary of Post Approval Monitoring can be found in Appendix B.

Of the 57 programs reviewed during the 2014 Post Approval Monitoring cycle, 20 programs or 35 percent met the projections listed in the program proposal or exceeded productivity benchmarks. This is a slight increase from the percentage of programs that achieved benchmarks during 2013.

However, many under-performing programs are meeting at least one of the benchmarks in either enrollment or graduation. This was the case in 22 of the 57 monitored programs that failed to meet benchmarks.

In the remaining 15 under-performing programs, both enrollment and graduation benchmarks are not being met, indicating that the program is in true peril of failing to reach the institutionally developed projections that indicate success.

Perhaps the greatest concerns emerge when a program is completing the 5 year Post Approval Monitoring Cycle, yet has failed to achieve the benchmarks set out in the program proposal. The full summary of Under-Performing Programs Completing Monitoring Cycle can be found in Table 3. Not only are these under-performing but they also are considered low producing programs.

Table 3: Under-Performing Programs Completing Monitoring Cycle

| Institution | Academic Program/ Degree Level | Projected Graduates during PAM Cycle | Actual Graduates during PAM Cycle | Average Graduates during PAM Cycle |
|--------------------|---|---|--|---|
| Austin Peay | Chemical Eng Tech, AAS | 231 | 131 | 26 |
| Middle Tennessee | Forensic Science, BS | 30 | 11 | 2 |
| Middle Tennessee | Computational Science, PhD | 6 | 0 | -- |
| Middle Tennessee | Molecular Biosciences, PhD | 4 | 0 | -- |
| Walters State | Clean Energy Tech, AAS | 20 | 2 | -- |

There are various reasons why programs may not meet projected benchmarks. Sometimes the implementation of programs are delayed due to difficulty hiring faculty, inadequate recruitment practices, changes in labor market demands, or other issues not within the control of the institution. For example, Hemlock Semiconductor has been the primary employer for graduates of the Chemical Engineering Technology program at APSU. When the plant closed, the program was directly impacted and the result is a significant reduction in the number of students completing the degree.

Programs that did not meet benchmarks during the monitoring period completed a Program Productivity Plan that addressed deficiencies and provided specific plans for corrective actions. Although the Program Productivity Plan serves to help improve the program, many of these under-performing programs will ultimately move from the PAM Cycle to the low producing listing of academic programs.

In the January 2014 Academic Program Review report, five programs completed their final year of post-approval monitoring. However, these programs failed to meet both enrollment and graduation benchmarks and therefore remained on monitoring status during 2014. These programs and their current status are reflected in Table 4.

Table 4: Under-Performing Programs: Monitoring Cycle Extended

| Institution | Academic Program | Average Graduates during PAM Cycle |
|---|--------------------------------|---|
| East Tennessee State University | Early Childhood Education, PhD | -- |
| <i>Status:</i> Enrollment has increased to 23 students and anticipates awarding 4 degrees in 2015. | | |
| Middle Tennessee State University | Literacy Studies, PhD | 1 |
| <i>Status:</i> Program is making significant improvement with 10 degrees awarded in 2013-14 and 34 doctoral students currently enrolled. | | |
| Tennessee State University | Urban Studies, BS | 2 |
| <i>Status:</i> Enrollment has increased to 24 students and anticipates awarding 10 degrees in 2016. | | |
| University of Memphis | Architecture, MS | 3 |
| <i>Status:</i> Program is making good progress towards the expected five graduates for Master's degree programs with the awarding of four degrees in 2013-14. | | |
| UT Knoxville | Nutritional Sciences, PhD | 2 |
| <i>Status:</i> This program is making significant improvement with three degrees awarded in 2013-14 | | |

and five students have defended their dissertations during the summer/fall 2014 terms.

3) Performance Funding Qualitative Reviews

The THEC Performance Funding Quality Assurance program requires institutions to evaluate undergraduate and graduate programs against a range of measures, ensuring that all degree programs provide an appropriately rigorous academic pathway and meet established national quality measures.

As the completion agenda continues, it is necessary to provide a clear assurance that the quality of academic programs is sustained. This assurance is provided via two primary methods:

- Academic audit/program review process
- Accreditation status

Academic Program Review: The purpose of academic program review is to ensure that standards of the discipline are being met and adequate financial support is evident. Each program is reviewed according to accreditation review cycles or at least once every five to seven years by THEC program evaluation criteria.

Table 5: Academic Program Evaluation by Type, 2013-14

| | Traditional Program Review | Academic Audit |
|------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| TBR Universities | 27 | 15 |
| UT System | 40 | 0 |
| TBR Community Colleges | 6 | 25 |
| Total | 73 | 40 |

Traditional program reviews are conducted by a qualified, out of state faculty member that provides an external review of program performance. These reviewers are approved by system staff and THEC staff, and provide a unique perspective to assist institutions in the quality assurance process. The UT system solely utilizes the program review process for program evaluation.

Academic Audits are carried out by select TBR faculty evaluators, and follow a prescribed process to determine program health in learning objectives, curriculum, teaching and learning, student learning assessment, quality assurance, overall assessment, previous audit response, and support. Effective with the 2010-15 performance funding cycle, associate degree programs that contain embedded certificates are evaluated as part of the respective associate degree program.

Accreditation Status: Accreditation by a professional, discipline specific accreditor is perhaps the most rigorous evaluation of an academic program. These accreditors, all of whom are approved by THEC, provide invaluable subject-specific insight into whether programs are truly preparing students for success in their selected field.

Across both systems, 587 programs are eligible for accreditation. Eligibility is determined when all Tennessee institutions agree on a specific accreditor as best representing qualitative standards for each discipline.

Currently, all programs are accredited, except for newly approved programs (56) and one program in which accreditation has been rescinded. This results in 99 percent of the eligible programs being either accredited or in the process of seeking accreditation. In the sole instance where accreditation was not achieved, the institution’s performance funding score was negatively impacted.

The accreditation status of Tennessee’s public institutions is available for review in Appendix C.

4) Program Productivity Review

With the announcement of the moratorium in January 2014, THEC staff conducted a detailed analysis of each institution’s academic program offerings. This review included an analysis of new programs (Post Approval Monitoring) and mature program productivity. Results from this review were then compiled into a comprehensive report for system and institutional leaders to utilize during the evaluation process. THEC requested the governing boards to carefully review the program productivity data (2008-09 through 2012-13) and asked for a determination of program action recommendation (retention, consolidation, inactivation, or termination).

This review of program productivity data identified programs that were not meeting nationally-identified graduate production benchmarks:

- Average of ten graduates per year over a five-year period for baccalaureate and pre-baccalaureate programs
- Average of five graduates for master’s programs over five-years, and
- Average of three graduates for doctoral programs over this same period of time.

Table 6: Program Productivity Review

| | Total Program Offerings | Programs Meeting Benchmarks | % Programs Meeting Benchmarks | Low-Producing Programs |
|------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| TBR Universities | 630 | 587 | 93% | 43 |
| UT System | 414 | 352 | 85% | 62 |
| TBR Community Colleges | 535 | 446 | 83% | 89 |
| Total | 1579 | 1385 | 88% | 196 |

- The State’s academic program inventory includes close to 1600 programs with approximately 1400 programs or 88 percent achieving the national benchmarks.
- At the universities, 105 programs did not achieve the projected benchmarks. The distribution of these programs were almost equally divided between undergraduate (58 programs) and graduate programs (47 programs).

- The majority of the graduate programs that did not achieve the minimum graduation were Master's degree programs. However, all of the Master's program offerings at Austin Peay, Middle Tennessee, Tennessee State, UT Chattanooga and UT Martin achieved on average five graduates over the five-year period.
- Seven of the 29 under-performing Master's programs achieved on average two graduates during the reporting period. These seven programs were at East Tennessee, UT Knoxville and UT Health Science Center. All programs were either in the biological sciences or the health fields.
- Doctoral programs that have achieved maturity are expected to achieve three graduates annually. The productivity study revealed that 18 doctoral programs were under-performing. Primarily the Engineering doctoral programs did not achieve the average benchmark.
- Of the close to 90 low-producing programs at the community colleges, 16 programs were recommended for termination. The majority of the programs terminated were three RODP programs: Web Technology (Associate), Web Page Authoring (Certificate) and Professional Studies (Associate). These program terminations occurred at six community colleges.
- The community colleges recommended 48 under-performing programs be retained with submission of action plans to increase productivity. For example, the Associate of Science Teaching program that is offered at four of the community colleges submitted a common corrective action plan to focus on ways to prepare students for passing the required PRAXIS I exam.

The overall program productivity status of Tennessee's public institutions is available for review in Appendix D. Appendix E provides the inventory of under-performing programs along with the governing board's recommendations.

The Academic Program Review included analysis of not only under-performing programs, but also sought to identify those programs which are highly productive and are worthy of mention as successful academic programs at each institution.

The distribution of productive programs among four year institutions was diverse, ranging from health professions programs to interdisciplinary programs intended for adult students.

However, among community colleges, the General Transfer Associate degree intended to prepare students for admission to a four year university was the most productive program. This indicates that the vast majority of degrees awarded at the associate level are to students likely seeking to fulfill the general education requirements of a bachelor's degree program.

**Top Producing Programs by Institution
Based on 5-Year Average (2008-09 through 2012-13)**

Tennessee Board of Regents - Universities

Austin Peay State University

- Bachelor Business Admin, BBA
- Master's Teaching, MAT

East Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Nursing, BSN
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Pharmacy, PharmD

Middle Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Liberal Studies, BS
- Master's Curriculum and Instruction, MEd
- Doctoral Human Performance, PhD

Tennessee State University

- Bachelor Teacher Education, BS
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Doctor of Physical Therapy, DPT

Tennessee Technological University

- Bachelor Teacher Education, BS
- Master's Instructional Leadership, MA
- Doctoral Engineering, PhD

University of Memphis

- Bachelor Professional Studies, BS
- Master's Instructional Leadership, MAT/MS
- Doctoral Psychology, PhD and Business Administration, PhD

University of Tennessee System

University of Tennessee- Chattanooga

- Bachelor Business Administration, BS
- Master's Business Administration, MBA
- Doctoral Doctor of Physical Therapy, DPT

University of Tennessee- Knoxville

- Bachelor Psychology, BA
- Master's Business Administration, MBA
- Doctoral Education, PhD

University of Tennessee- Martin

- Bachelor Individualized Program, BS
- Master's Business Administration, MBA

University of Tennessee Health Science Center

- Bachelor Nursing, BSN
- Master's Nursing, MSN
- Doctoral Pharmacy, PharmD

Appendix A
2014 Program Activity Report: New Programs

| | Institution | Academic Program | Degree Level |
|-----------|--------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------|
| 1 | Austin Peay | Engineering Technology | Masters |
| 2 | Austin Peay | Theatre/Dance | Bachelors |
| 3 | East Tennessee | Digital Marketing | Masters |
| 4 | East Tennessee | Graphic Design | Baccalaureate |
| 5 | Middle Tennessee | Theatre | Baccalaureate |
| 6 | Tennessee State | Computer Science | Masters |
| 7 | Univ of Memphis | Health Systems and Policy | Doctoral |
| 8 | Chattanooga | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 9 | Cleveland | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 10 | Cleveland | Medical Informatics | Associate |
| 11 | Cleveland | Paramedic | Certificate |
| 12 | Cleveland | Paramedic | Associate |
| 13 | Columbia | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 14 | Columbia | Early Childhood Education (RODP) | Associate |
| 15 | Dyersburg | Mechatronics: Programmable Logic | Certificate |
| 16 | Dyersburg | Mechatronics: Industrial Electricity | Certificate |
| 17 | Dyersburg | Mechatronics: Mechanical Components I | Certificate |
| 18 | Dyersburg | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 19 | Jackson | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 20 | Motlow | Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 21 | Motlow | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 22 | Nashville | Police Administration | Certificate |
| 23 | Northeast | Entrepreneurship | Certificate |
| 24 | Northeast | Customer Service and Sales | Certificate |
| 25 | Pellissippi | Computer Aided Manufacturing | Certificate |
| 26 | Roane | Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 27 | Roane | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 28 | Roane | Medical Informatics | Associate |
| 29 | Roane | Financial Services | Associate |
| 30 | Southwest | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 31 | Volunteer | Veterinary Assistant | Certificate |
| 32 | Volunteer | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |
| 33 | Volunteer | Computer Information Technology | Associate |
| 34 | Walters | Advanced Emergency Medical Technician | Certificate |

Appendix A
2014 Program Activity: Terminated Programs

| | Institution | Academic Program | Degree Level |
|-----------|--------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------|
| 1 | Middle Tennessee | Office Management | Baccalaureate |
| 2 | Univ of Memphis | Applied Computer Science | Masters |
| 3 | Univ of Memphis | Merchandising and Consumer Sciences | Masters |
| 4 | UT Chattanooga | Rehabilitation Sciences | Baccalaureate |
| 5 | UT Knoxville | Industrial/Organizational Psychology | Doctorate |
| 6 | UT Martin | French | Baccalaureate |
| 7 | Nashville | Social Services | Associate |
| 8 | Roane | Composite Materials | Certificate |
| 9 | Southwest | Homeland Security | Certificate |
| 10 | Southwest | Home Manager | Certificate |
| 11 | Volunteer | Animal Care Technology | Certificate |
| 12 | Volunteer | Pre-Allied Health | Certificate |
| 13 | Volunteer | General Education Core | Certificate |
| 14 | Volunteer | Web Page Authoring | Certificate |
| 15 | Volunteer | Web Technology | Associate |

Appendix B 2013-14 Post Approval Monitoring

| | Institution | Academic Program | Met Enrollment Benchmark | Met Graduation Benchmark | Met No Benchmarks |
|----|--------------------|---|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1 | Austin Peay | Professional Science Masters, PSM | X | -- | |
| 2 | Austin Peay | Chemical Engineering Tech, Associate | | | X |
| 3 | East Tennessee | Appalachian Studies, MA | | -- | |
| 4 | East Tennessee | Bluegrass, OT & CM Studies, BA | X | | |
| 5 | East Tennessee | Geosciences, MS | X | X | |
| 6 | East Tennessee | International Affairs, BA | X | X | |
| 7 | East Tennessee | Sports Physiology and Performance, PhD | X | X | |
| 8 | Middle Tennessee | Assessment, Learning, and School Improvement, PhD | X | -- | |
| 9 | Middle Tennessee | Management, MS | | -- | |
| 10 | Middle Tennessee | Mechatronics Engineering, BS | X | -- | |
| 11 | Middle Tennessee | Computational Science, PhD | X | | |
| 12 | Middle Tennessee | Exercise Science, BS | X | X | |
| 13 | Middle Tennessee | Forensic Science, BS | X | | |
| 14 | Middle Tennessee | Horse Science, MS | | X | |
| 15 | Middle Tennessee | Information Systems, MS | X | X | |
| 16 | Middle Tennessee | International Affairs, MA | | X | |
| 17 | Middle Tennessee | Leisure and Sport Management, MS | X | X | |
| 18 | Middle Tennessee | Math & Science Education, PhD | X | X | |
| 19 | Middle Tennessee | Molecular Biosciences, PhD | X | | |
| 20 | Tennessee State | Public Health, MPH | | | X |
| 21 | Tennessee Tech | Environmental/ Sustainability, BS | X | X | |
| 22 | Tennessee Tech | Professional Science Masters, PSM | | X | |
| 23 | Univ of Memphis | Epidemiology, PhD | X | | |
| 24 | Univ of Memphis | Interior Design, BFA | | X | |
| 25 | Univ of Memphis | Social Work, MSW | | X | |
| 26 | Univ of Memphis | Social/Behavioral Science, PhD | | | X |
| 27 | UT Chattanooga | Athletic Training, MS | X | X | |
| 28 | UT Chattanooga | Doctor of Nursing Practice, DNP | | | X |
| 29 | UT Chattanooga | Integrated Studies, BS | X | X | |
| 30 | UT Chattanooga | Mathematics, MS | X | X | |
| 31 | UT Knoxville | Doctor of Nursing, DNP | X | | |
| 32 | UT Knoxville | Energy Science/Eng. Engineering, PhD | X | | |
| 33 | ROCC | Criminal Justice, Associate | | | X |
| 34 | Chattanooga | Applied Science, Associate | | X | |
| 35 | Chattanooga | Fine Arts, Associate | | X | |
| 36 | Chattanooga | Health Sciences, Associate | X | X | |
| 37 | Chattanooga | Process Technology, Certificate | | X | |

| | Institution | Academic Program | Met Enrollment Benchmark | Met Graduation Benchmark | Met No Benchmarks |
|----|--------------------|--|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 38 | Cleveland | Health Sciences, Associate | | | X |
| 39 | Cleveland | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 40 | Columbia | Adv. Integrated Industrial Tech, Associate | X | | |
| 41 | Columbia | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 42 | Columbia | Health Sciences, Associate | X | X | |
| 43 | Dyersburg | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 44 | Motlow | Mechatronics Technology, Associate | | X | |
| 45 | Nashville | Medical Informatics, Associate | X | | |
| 46 | Nashville | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 47 | Nashville | Health Sciences, Associate | X | | |
| 48 | Pellissippi | Fine Arts, Associate | X | | |
| 49 | Pellissippi | Health Sciences, AAS | | | X |
| 50 | Roane | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 51 | Southwest | Advanced Integrated Ind Tech, Associate | | | X |
| 52 | Volunteer | Entertainment Media Production, Associate | X | -- | |
| 53 | Volunteer | Fine Arts, Associate | X | -- | |
| 54 | Volunteer | Medical Informatics, Associate | X | -- | |
| 55 | Volunteer | Vet Tech, Associate | X | X | |
| 56 | Walters | Fine Arts, Associate | | | X |
| 57 | Walters | Clean Energy Technology, Associate | | | X |

2013-14 Post Approval Monitoring: Delayed Programs

| | Institution | Academic Program | Degree Level |
|---|--------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|
| 1 | UT Chattanooga | Occupational Therapy | Doctoral |
| 2 | Chattanooga | International Business | Certificate |
| 3 | Jackson | Occupational Therapy Assistant | Associate |
| 4 | Walters | Occupational Therapy Assistant | Associate |

**Appendix C
2013-14 Accreditation Status**

| Institution | Accreditable Programs | Accredited Programs | Programs Seeking Accreditation | Programs Failed Accreditation |
|--------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Austin Peay | 27 | 21 | 6 | |
| East Tennessee | 60 | 52 | 7 | 1 |
| Middle Tennessee | 55 | 49 | 6 | |
| Tennessee State | 44 | 43 | 1 | |
| Tennessee Tech | 35 | 34 | 1 | |
| Univ of Memphis | 72 | 69 | 3 | |
| TBR Universities | 293 | 268 | 24 | 1 |
| UT Chattanooga | 37 | 36 | 1 | |
| UT Knoxville | 66 | 62 | 4 | |
| UT Martin | 23 | 22 | 1 | |
| UT System | 126 | 120 | 6 | 0 |
| Chattanooga | 27 | 25 | 2 | |
| Cleveland | 5 | 3 | 2 | |
| Columbia | 11 | 7 | 4 | |
| Dyersburg | 8 | 4 | 4 | |
| Jackson | 10 | 8 | 2 | |
| Motlow | 7 | 2 | 5 | |
| Nashville | 12 | 11 | 1 | |
| Northeast | 10 | 10 | 0 | |
| Pellissippi | 7 | 6 | 1 | |
| Roane | 18 | 16 | 2 | |
| Southwest | 23 | 22 | 1 | |
| Volunteer | 16 | 15 | 1 | |
| Walters | 14 | 13 | 1 | |
| TBR Comm Colleges | 168 | 142 | 26 | 0 |
| Grand Total | 587 | 530 | 56 | 1 |

**Appendix D
2014 Program Productivity**

| | Total Program Offerings | Low- Producing Programs | Low- Producing Programs Retained | Programs Terminated | % Programs Meeting Benchmarks |
|---------------------------|--|--|---|--------------------------------|--|
| Austin Peay | 60 | 3 | 3 | 0 | 95% |
| East Tennessee | 130 | 16 | 15 | 1 | 88% |
| Middle Tennessee | 128 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 96% |
| Tennessee State | 81 | 6 | 5 | 0 | 93% |
| Tennessee Tech | 67 | 7 | 7 | 0 | 90% |
| Univ of Memphis | 164 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 96% |
| TBR Universities | 630 | 43 | 40 | 2 | 93% |
| UT Chattanooga | 96 | 12 | 11 | 1 | 89% |
| UT Knoxville | 241 | 34 | 30 | 4 | 86% |
| UT Martin | 42 | 9 | 8 | 1 | 79% |
| UT Health Science Center | 35 | 8 | 8 | 0 | 77% |
| UT System | 414 | 63 | 57 | 6 | 85% |
| Total Universities | 1044 | 106 | 97 | 8 | 90% |
| Chattanooga | 76 | 13 | 13 | 0 | 83% |
| Cleveland | 39 | 4 | 1 | 3 | 90% |
| Columbia | 28 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 89% |
| Dyersburg | 31 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 81% |
| Jackson | 21 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 71% |
| Motlow | 18 | 4 | 4 | 0 | 78% |
| Nashville | 51 | 15 | 11 | 4 | 71% |
| Northeast | 34 | 5 | 5 | 0 | 85% |
| Pellissippi | 59 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 98% |
| Roane | 37 | 7 | 4 | 3 | 81% |
| Southwest | 53 | 11 | 10 | 1 | 79% |
| Volunteer | 45 | 3 | 1 | 2 | 93% |
| Walters | 43 | 8 | 5 | 3 | 81% |
| TBR Comm Colleges | 535 | 89 | 73 | 16 | 83% |
| Grand Total | 1579 | 195 | 170 | 24 | 88% |

Appendix E Under-Performing Programs

| | Institution | CIP Code | Academic Program | Average | Board Recommendation |
|---|------------------|----------|----------------------------------|---------|----------------------|
| Benchmark for Pre- and Baccalaureate Programs: 10 graduates over a 5 year period | | | | | |
| 1 | Austin Peay | 15.0000 | Engineering Tech (associate) | 2.0 | Retain |
| 2 | Austin Peay | 38.0101 | Philosophy | 3.4 | Retain |
| 3 | Austin Peay | 40.0801 | Physics | 8.6 | Retain |
| 4 | East Tennessee | 05.0207 | Women's Studies | 1.8 | Retain |
| 5 | East Tennessee | 50.0501 | Theatre | 4.8 | Retain |
| 6 | East Tennessee | 45.0601 | Economics | 5.0 | Retain |
| 7 | East Tennessee | 51.2202 | Environmental Health | 5.4 | Retain |
| 8 | East Tennessee | 40.0601 | Geology | 5.8 | Retain |
| 9 | East Tennessee | 40.0801 | Physics | 7.6 | Retain |
| 10 | East Tennessee | 45.0701 | Geography | 8.2 | Terminate |
| 11 | East Tennessee | 38.0101 | Philosophy | 8.4 | Retain |
| 12 | East Tennessee | 50.0408 | Interior Design | 8.5 | Retain |
| 13 | East Tennessee | 52.0601 | Economics | 8.8 | Retain |
| 14 | Middle Tennessee | 50.0703 | Art History | 3.8 | Retain |
| 15 | Middle Tennessee | 52.0204 | Office Management | 5.0 | Terminate |
| 16 | Middle Tennessee | 15.0303 | Environmental Science & Tech | 5.2 | Retain |
| 17 | Middle Tennessee | 30.9999 | Integrative Studies | 5.8 | Retain |
| 18 | Middle Tennessee | 40.0801 | Physics | 7.0 | Retain |
| 19 | Tennessee State | 13.1210 | Early Childhood Education | 5.4 | Retain |
| 20 | Tennessee State | 14.0401 | Architectural Engineering | 6.0 | Retain |
| 21 | Tennessee State | 27.0101 | Mathematics | 6.6 | Retain |
| 22 | Tennessee State | 15.0801 | Aeronautical & Industrial Tech | 8.0 | Retain |
| 23 | Tennessee Tech | 40.0801 | Physics | 3.6 | Retain |
| 24 | Tennessee Tech | 52.0601 | Economics | 4.2 | Retain |
| 25 | Tennessee Tech | 30.9999 | International Business & Culture | 7.8 | Retain |
| 26 | Tennessee Tech | 27.0101 | Mathematics | 9.4 | Retain |
| 27 | Univ of Memphis | 40.0801 | Physics | 1.8 | Retain |
| 28 | Univ of Memphis | 50.0703 | Art History | 5.6 | Retain |
| 29 | Univ of Memphis | 14.0901 | Computer Engineering | 6.8 | Retain |
| 30 | UT Chattanooga | 27.0101 | Mathematics | 1.0 | Retain |
| 31 | UT Chattanooga | 13.1302 | Art Education | 2.4 | Consolidate |
| 32 | UT Chattanooga | 40.0801 | Physics | 3.2 | Retain |
| 33 | UT Chattanooga | 50.0501 | Theatre | 4.4 | Retain |
| 34 | UT Chattanooga | 50.0901 | Music | 6.2 | Retain |
| 35 | UT Chattanooga | 27.0301 | Applied Mathematics | 6.4 | Retain |

| | Institution | CIP Code | Academic Program | Average | Board Recommendation |
|---|--------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|
| Benchmark for Pre- and Baccalaureate Programs: 10 graduates over a 5 year period | | | | | |
| 36 | UT Chattanooga | 40.0601 | Geology | 6.4 | Retain |
| 37 | UT Chattanooga | 38.9999 | Philosophy & Religion | 7.0 | Retain |
| 38 | UT Chattanooga | 13.1001 | Exceptional Learning, K-12 | 8.4 | Retain |
| 39 | UT Chattanooga | 51.2308 | Rehabilitation Sciences | 9.2 | Terminate |
| 40 | UT Health Science | 51.1005 | Medical Lab Science | 7.6 | Retain |
| 41 | UT Knoxville | 03.0204 | Natural Resources & Env Economics | 2.3 | Retain |
| 42 | UT Knoxville | 51.1302 | Business Analytics | 2.5 | Retain |
| 43 | UT Knoxville | 16.0902 | Italian | 3.2 | Consolidate |
| 44 | UT Knoxville | 16.0402 | Russian Studies | 4.0 | Consolidate |
| 45 | UT Knoxville | 51.1005 | Clinical Laboratory Science | 4.2 | Retain |
| 46 | UT Knoxville | 30.9999 | Pre-Professional Programs | 5.2 | Retain |
| 47 | UT Knoxville | 16.0501 | German | 6.2 | Consolidate |
| 48 | UT Knoxville | 01.0801 | Ag Leadership, Educ & Comm | 7.5 | Retain |
| 49 | UT Knoxville | 27.0501 | Statistics | 8.8 | Retain |
| 50 | UT Martin | 50.0999 | Music | 1.6 | Retain |
| 51 | UT Martin | 16.0901 | French | 1.8 | Terminate |
| 52 | UT Martin | 38.0101 | Philosophy | 2.2 | Retain |
| 53 | UT Martin | 27.0101 | Mathematics (4) | 2.4 | Retain |
| 54 | UT Martin | 16.0905 | Spanish | 6.0 | Retain |
| 55 | UT Martin | 45.0901 | International Studies | 7.0 | Retain |
| 56 | UT Martin | 11.0701 | Computer Science | 8.0 | Retain |
| 57 | UT Martin | 13.1001 | Special Education | 8.0 | Retain |
| 58 | UT Martin | 40.0601 | Geoscience | 9.2 | Retain |

| | Institution | CIP Code | Academic Program | Average | Board Recommendation |
|--|--------------------|-----------------|--|----------------|-----------------------------|
| Benchmark for Master's Programs: 5 graduates over a 5 year period | | | | | |
| 1 | East Tennessee | 51.2202 | Environmental Health | 1.0 | Retain |
| 2 | East Tennessee | 13.0401 | Educational Leadership | 4.2 | Retain |
| 3 | East Tennessee | 51.9999 | Allied Health | 4.3 | Retain |
| 4 | Tennessee Tech | 11.0701 | Computer Science | 2.6 | Retain |
| 5 | Tennessee Tech | 14.0701 | Chemical Engineering | 3.8 | Retain |
| 6 | Tennessee Tech | 27.0101 | Mathematics | 4.2 | Retain |
| 7 | Univ of Memphis | 42.2806 | Educational Psychology & Research | 2.5 | Retain |
| 8 | Univ of Memphis | 45.0601 | Economics | 2.6 | Retain |
| 9 | UT Knoxville | 26.9999 | Comparative/Experimental Medicine | 1.3 | Retain |
| 10 | UT Knoxville | 26.9999 | Life Sciences | 1.8 | Retain |
| 11 | UT Knoxville | 14.3201 | Polymer Engineering | 2.0 | Terminate |
| 12 | UT Knoxville | 26.0503 | Microbiology | 2.2 | Retain |
| 13 | UT Knoxville | 14.1301 | Engineering Science | 2.4 | Retain |
| 14 | UT Knoxville | 13.0401 | Educational Administration | 3.0 | Retain |
| 15 | UT Knoxville | 38.0101 | Philosophy | 3.0 | Retain |
| 16 | UT Knoxville | 26.0202 | Biochem/Cell/Molecular Biology | 3.2 | Retain |
| 17 | UT Knoxville | 16.0905 | Spanish | 3.6 | Retain |
| 18 | UT Knoxville | 01.1105 | Entomology & Plant Pathology | 3.8 | Retain |
| 19 | UT Knoxville | 16.0901 | French | 3.8 | Retain |
| 20 | UT Knoxville | 01.0901 | Animal Science | 4.0 | Retain |
| 21 | UT Knoxville | 26.1301 | Ecology & Evolutionary Biology | 4.0 | Retain |
| 22 | UT Knoxville | 01.1202 | Environmental & Soil Sciences | 4.0 | Retain |
| 23 | UT Knoxville | 03.0501 | Forestry | 4.4 | Retain |
| 24 | UT Knoxville | 40.0501 | Chemistry | 4.4 | Retain |
| 25 | UT Health Science | 51.2004 | Pharmaceutical Sciences | 1.0 | Retain |
| 26 | UT Health Science | 51.2212 | Health Outcomes & Policy Research | 1.0 | Retain |
| 27 | UT Health Science | 26.9999 | Biomedical Sciences | 3.5 | Retain |
| 28 | UT Health Science | 14.0501 | Biomedical Engineering (joint program with Univ of Memphis) | 4.3 | Retain |
| 29 | UT Health Science | 51.1002 | Cytopathology Practice | 4.3 | Retain |

| | Institution | CIP Code | Academic Program | Average | Board Recommendation |
|--|-------------------|----------|---|---------|----------------------|
| Benchmark for Doctoral Programs: 3 graduates over a 5 year period | | | | | |
| 1 | East Tennessee | 51.2201 | Public Health | 2.0 | Retain |
| 2 | East Tennessee | 42.0101 | Psychology | 2.0 | Retain |
| 3 | East Tennessee | 51.2202 | Environmental Health Science | 2.0 | Retain |
| 4 | Tennessee State | 14.0901 | Computer & Info Systems Engineering | 1.6 | Retain |
| 5 | Tennessee State | 44.0401 | Public Administration | 2.0 | Retain |
| 6 | Univ of Memphis | 51.0204 | Comm Sciences/Disorders | 2.2 | Retain |
| 7 | UT Knoxville | 14.0301 | Biosystems Engineering | 1.2 | Retain |
| 8 | UT Knoxville | 52.1301 | Management Science | 1.0 | Retain |
| 9 | UT Knoxville | 14.0201 | Aerospace Engineering | 1.4 | Retain |
| 10 | UT Knoxville | 01.0901 | Animal Science | 1.6 | Retain |
| 11 | UT Knoxville | 01.1001 | Food Science And Technology | 2.0 | Retain |
| 12 | UT Knoxville | 14.0701 | Chemical Engineering | 2.2 | Retain |
| 13 | UT Knoxville | 14.3201 | Polymer Engineering | 2.3 | Terminate |
| 14 | UT Knoxville | 14.0901 | Computer Engineering | 2.4 | Retain |
| 15 | UT Knoxville | 38.0101 | Philosophy | 2.4 | Retain |
| 16 | UT Chattanooga | 14.2701 | Computational Engineering Biomedical Engineering | 1.8 | Retain |
| 17 | UT Health Science | 14.0501 | (joint program with Univ of Memphis) | 1.3 | Retain |
| 18 | UT Health Science | 51.2212 | Health Outcomes & Policy Research | 2.0 | Retain |

| | Community College | CIP Code | Academic Program | Degree Level | 3 Yr. Average | Board Recommendation |
|--|-------------------|----------|--------------------------------------|--------------|---------------|----------------------|
| Benchmark for Certificate and Associate Programs: 10 graduates over a 3 year period | | | | | | |
| 1 | Chattanooga | 52.0302 | Accounting Technology | Associate | 9 | Retain |
| 2 | Chattanooga | 50.0506 | Acting: Professional | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 3 | Chattanooga | 52.0302 | Basic Bookkeeping | Certificate | 0 | Retain |
| 4 | Chattanooga | 52.0302 | Basic Tax Accounting | Certificate | 0 | Retain |
| 5 | Chattanooga | 51.0901 | Cardiovascular Sonography | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 6 | Chattanooga | 51.0910 | Diagnostic Medical Sonography | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 7 | Chattanooga | 15.0612 | Electrical & Instrumentation Systems | Certificate | 1 | Retain |
| 8 | Chattanooga | 52.0701 | Entrepreneurship | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 9 | Chattanooga | 15.0612 | Industrial Systems Engineering Tech | Associate | 6 | Retain |
| 10 | Chattanooga | 15.0805 | Mechanical Systems | Certificate | 1 | Retain |
| 11 | Chattanooga | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 12 | Chattanooga | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 13 | Chattanooga | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 14 | Cleveland | 13.0101 | Teaching | Associate | 1 | Retain |

| | Community College | CIP Code | Academic Program | Degree Level | 3 Yr. Average | Board Recommendation |
|----|--------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| 15 | Cleveland | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | -- | Terminate |
| 16 | Cleveland | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Terminate |
| 17 | Cleveland | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Terminate |
| 18 | Columbia | 50.9999 | Commercial Entertainment | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 19 | Columbia | 19.0706 | Early Childhood Education | Certificate | 6 | Retain |
| 20 | Columbia | 10.0201 | Film Crew Technology | Certificate | 6 | Retain |
| 21 | Columbia | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 22 | Columbia | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 23 | Columbia | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Retain |
| 24 | Dyersburg | 43.0107 | Corrections & Law Enforcement | Certificate | 5 | Retain |
| 25 | Dyersburg | 43.0107 | Criminal Justice | Associate | 3 | Retain |
| 26 | Dyersburg | 32.0111 | General Technology | Associate | 3 | Retain |
| 27 | Dyersburg | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 28 | Dyersburg | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | 1 | Retain |
| 29 | Dyersburg | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 3 | Retain |
| 30 | Jackson | 51.0904 | EMT-Paramedic (1 year) | Certificate | 3 | Retain |
| 31 | Jackson | 51.0904 | EMT-Paramedic (2 year) | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 32 | Jackson | 15.0612 | Industrial Technology | Associate | 9 | Retain |
| 33 | Jackson | 51.1004 | Medical Lab Technician | Associate | 9 | Retain |
| 34 | Jackson | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 35 | Jackson | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 36 | Motlow | 32.0111 | General Technology | Associate | 7 | Retain |
| 37 | Motlow | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Retain |
| 38 | Motlow | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 39 | Motlow | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Retain |
| 40 | Nashville | 50.0409 | 3D Design and Graphics | Certificate | 2 | Retain |
| 41 | Nashville | 11.0101 | Computer Info Systems | Associate | 8 | Retain |
| 42 | Nashville | 01.0605 | Horticulture & Land Gardening | Certificate | 7 | Retain |
| 43 | Nashville | 46.0302 | Industrial Electrical Maintenance | Certificate | 6 | Retain |
| 44 | Nashville | 52.0203 | Logistics | Certificate | 2 | Retain |
| 45 | Nashville | 22.0302 | Paralegal Studies | Associate | 8 | Retain |
| 46 | Nashville | 50.0605 | Photography | Associate | 8 | Retain |
| 47 | Nashville | 52.0203 | Supply Chain | Certificate | 1 | Retain |
| 48 | Nashville | 13.0101 | Teaching | Associate | 8 | Retain |
| 49 | Nashville | 52.0203 | Transportation | Certificate | 1 | Retain |
| 50 | Nashville | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 2 | Terminate |
| 51 | Nashville | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Terminate |
| 52 | Nashville | 44.0201 | Social Services | Associate | 3 | Terminate |
| 53 | Nashville | 47.0604 | Automotive Technology | Associate | 4 | Terminate |

| | Community College | CIP Code | Academic Program | Degree Level | 3 Yr. Average | Board Recommendation |
|----|--------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------------|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| 54 | Nashville | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | 2 | Retain |
| 55 | Northeast | 43.0107 | Public Safety & Justice Admin | Associate | 4 | Retain |
| 56 | Northeast | 13.0101 | Teaching | Associate | 9 | Retain |
| 57 | Northeast | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Retain |
| 58 | Northeast | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 59 | Northeast | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 60 | Pellissippi | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Retain |
| 61 | Roane | 11.0101 | Computer Science | Certificate | 2 | Retain |
| 62 | Roane | 45.0702 | Geographic Info Systems | Associate | 3 | Retain |
| 63 | Roane | 22.0302 | Paralegal Studies | Associate | 7 | Retain |
| 64 | Roane | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 1 | Terminate |
| 65 | Roane | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Terminate |
| 66 | Roane | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Terminate |
| 67 | Roane | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Certificate | 7 | Retain |
| 68 | Southwest | 15.0303 | Basic Electronics Technician | Certificate | 8 | Retain |
| 69 | Southwest | 26.1201 | Biotechnology | Associate | 8 | Retain |
| 70 | Southwest | 52.0101 | Customs Brokerage | Certificate | 3 | Retain |
| 71 | Southwest | 51.3104 | Dietetic Technician | Associate | 6 | Retain |
| 72 | Southwest | 47.0101 | Electronic Technology | Associate | 5 | Retain |
| 73 | Southwest | 19.0505 | Food Preparation, Safety & Service | Certificate | 9 | Retain |
| 74 | Southwest | 13.0101 | Teaching | Associate | 4 | Retain |
| 75 | Southwest | 52.0201 | Mid-Management | Associate | 6 | Terminate |
| 76 | Southwest | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 2 | Retain |
| 77 | Southwest | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 78 | Southwest | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 79 | Volunteer | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Terminate |
| 80 | Volunteer | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Terminate |
| 81 | Volunteer | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 2 | Retain |
| 82 | Walters | 32.0111 | General Technology | Associate | -- | Retain |
| 83 | Walters | 01.0601 | Horticulture | Certificate | 3 | Retain |
| 84 | Walters | 01.0605 | Landscape Management | Certificate | -- | Retain |
| 85 | Walters | 01.0603 | Production Horticulture | Associate | 5 | Retain |
| 86 | Walters | 24.0102 | Professional Studies (RODP) | Associate | 2 | Terminate |
| 87 | Walters | 11.0801 | Web Page Authoring (RODP) | Certificate | -- | Terminate |
| 88 | Walters | 11.0301 | Information Technology | Associate | 4 | Terminate |
| 89 | Walters | 11.0801 | Web Technology (RODP) | Associate | -- | Retain |