SUBJECT: 2012 Lottery Scholarship Annual Report
ACTION RECOMMENDED: Information

BACKGROUND INFORMATION: Pursuant to T.C.A. § 49-4-903(b), the Tennessee Higher Education Commission is to report findings related to lottery scholarship programs to the General Assembly.

Staff will present an overview of the annual legislative report, which details the postsecondary outcomes of scholarship recipients from the program's inception (Fall 2004) through Fall 2011, by student demographic and academic characteristics. As in the past, this year's report reinforces the importance of high school preparation and performance in renewing scholarship awards and collegiate success in general. Additionally, this year's report releases for the first time ever information relative to student employment of lottery scholarship recipients. The report confirms the widely-held impression about student employment - that many of scholarship recipients obtained a job to help pay for college.

The report's major sections are:

- Program Overview and Recipient Demographics
- Scholarship Renewal
- Graduation Rates with TELS Intact
- 6-year Graduation Rates for TELS Recipients
- College-retention for Scholarship Non-renewals
- Scholarship Recipients and Employment During College

The full report can be viewed on our website at www.tn.gov/thec under meeting agenda on the home page.

## 2012 Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship Fact Book

Tennessee Higher Education Commission July 26, 2012

## Purpose

This report is prepared pursuant to T.C.A. §49-4903(b), which directs the Tennessee Higher Education Commission (THEC) to:
"...provide assistance to the general assembly and to the Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation (TSAC) by researching and analyzing data concerning the scholarship and grant programs created under this part, including, but not limited to, student success and scholarship renewal."

## Overview

A descriptive overview of the Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship program.

Specifically, the report provides...

- An overview of the program
- Scholarship renewal rates and trends
- Graduation rates and trends
- Retention rates and trends
...for students that renew their award, and for those that do not.


## Section 1: <br> Program Overview



Maximum Award Amount of HOPE as a Percentage of Average Tuition and Fees at Public Institutions, 2004-05 through 2011-12


## TELS Freshmen as a Percent of All First-time

 Freshmen by System, Fall 2004 through Fall 2011 *

* Data from 2010 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2011.


# Qualifications Met by TELS First-time Freshmen 

 (HOPE and ASPIRE Only), Fall 2004 through Fall 2011 *

* Data from 2010 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2011.

Tennessee Higher Education Commission

## Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by System, TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2011



Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2011


## Section 2: Scholarship Renewal



One-year Renewal Rate by Qualifications Met
(HOPE and ASPIRE Only), TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010 *


* Data from 2009 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2010.



# Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, Renewing TELS Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010 



Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, Non-renewing TELS Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010


## Section 3: <br> Graduation Rates with TELS Intact

# Graduation Rate with Scholarship Intact by System, TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2006 * 



* Data from 2005 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2006.


## Graduation Rate with Scholarship Intact

 by Scholarship Type, TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2006 *

[^0]Graduation Rate with Scholarship Intact by Qualifications Met (HOPE and ASPIRE Only),


[^1]
## Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by

 Scholarship Type, TELS Students who Graduated with Scholarship Intact, Fall 2004 through Fall 2006

## Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by

 Scholarship Type, TELS Students who Did Not Graduate with Scholarship Intact, Fall 2004 through Fall 2006

Tennessee Higher Education Commission

# Section 4: <br> Six-year Graduation Rates for TELS Recipients 

## Six-year Graduation Rate with or without Scholarship Intact by System,

 TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 and Fall 2005 *

* Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.


## Six-year Graduation Rate with or without Scholarship Intact by Scholarship Type,

 TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 and Fall 2005 *

* Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.

Six-year Graduation Rate with or without Scholarship Intact by Qualifications Met (HOPE and ASPIRE Only),
TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 and Fall 2005 *


* Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.

Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, Graduates within Six-years with or without TELS Intact, Fall 2004 and Fall 2005 Cohorts


Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, Non-graduates within Six-years with or without TELS Intact, Fall 2004 and Fall 2005 Cohorts


## Six-year Graduation Rate, Non-PELL Eligible TELS Recipients, 2005 Cohort, N = 13,999 *

|  | 29 or <br> Above | 25 to <br> 28 | 21 to <br> 24 | 17 to <br> 20 | 17 or <br> less | Unknown | Grand <br> Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3.75 or Above | $88 \%$ | $84 \%$ | $82 \%$ | $79 \%$ | $80 \%$ |  | $84 \%$ |
| 3.5 to 3.75 | $73 \%$ | $74 \%$ | $71 \%$ | $64 \%$ | $53 \%$ |  | $71 \%$ |
| 3.25 to 3.5 | $60 \%$ | $66 \%$ | $63 \%$ | $55 \%$ | $43 \%$ |  | $60 \%$ |
| 3 to 3.25 | $56 \%$ | $49 \%$ | $53 \%$ | $51 \%$ | $28 \%$ |  | $51 \%$ |
| 2.75 to 3 | $63 \%$ | $48 \%$ | $43 \%$ | $41 \%$ |  |  | $44 \%$ |
| 2.5 to 2.75 | $22 \%$ | $34 \%$ | $39 \%$ |  |  |  | $38 \%$ |
| 2.25 to 2.5 | $50 \%$ | $15 \%$ | $32 \%$ |  |  |  | $30 \%$ |
| 2.25 or less | $50 \%$ | $18 \%$ | $24 \%$ |  |  |  |  |
| Unknown |  |  |  |  |  | $53 \%$ |  |
| Grand Total | $80 \%$ | $71 \%$ | $61 \%$ | $57 \%$ | $38 \%$ | $56 \%$ | $64 \%$ |

[^2]
## Six-year Graduation Rate, PELL Eligible TELS Recipients, 2005 Cohort, $\mathrm{N}=5,496$ *

|  | 29 or <br> Above | $\begin{gathered} 25 \text { to } \\ 28 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 21 \text { to } \\ 24 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 17 \text { to } \\ 20 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 17 \text { or } \\ \text { less } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Unknown | Grand Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3.75 or Above | 81\% | 74\% | 70\% | 62\% | 64\% |  | 71\% |
| 3.5 to 3.75 | 50\% | 60\% | 62\% | 52\% | 43\% |  | 57\% |
| 3.25 to 3.5 | 58\% | 42\% | 48\% | 43\% | 34\% |  | 44\% |
| 3 to 3.25 | 60\% | 34\% | 39\% | 36\% | 29\% |  | 36\% |
| 2.75 to 3 | 33\% | 27\% | 35\% | 22\% |  |  | 29\% |
| 2.5 to 2.75 | 33\% | 18\% | 30\% |  |  |  | 28\% |
| 2.25 to 2.5 | 0\% | 13\% | 21\% |  |  |  | 20\% |
| 2.25 or less | 0\% | 0\% | 12\% |  |  |  | 10\% |
| Unknown |  |  |  |  |  |  | 37\% |
| Grand Total | 70\% | 55\% | 48\% | 42\% | 33\% | 37\% | 47\% |

[^3]
## Percentage Point Difference in Six-year Graduatio Rate Between PELL and Non-PELL Eligible TELS $\sim^{4}$ Recipients, 2005 Cohort *

|  | 29 or <br> Above | 25 to <br> 28 | 21 to <br> 24 | 17 to <br> 20 | 17 or <br> less | Unknown | Grand <br> Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3.75 or Above | $7 \%$ | $10 \%$ | $12 \%$ | $16 \%$ | $16 \%$ |  | $13 \%$ |
| 3.5 to 3.75 | $23 \%$ | $15 \%$ | $9 \%$ | $13 \%$ | $10 \%$ |  | $13 \%$ |
| 3.25 to 3.5 | $2 \%$ | $24 \%$ | $16 \%$ | $12 \%$ | $9 \%$ |  | $16 \%$ |
| 3 to 3.25 | $-4 \%$ | $15 \%$ | $13 \%$ | $15 \%$ | $0 \%$ |  | $14 \%$ |
| 2.75 to 3 | $29 \%$ | $22 \%$ | $8 \%$ | $18 \%$ |  |  | $15 \%$ |
| 2.5 to 2.75 | $-11 \%$ | $16 \%$ | $10 \%$ |  |  |  | $10 \%$ |
| 2.25 to 2.5 | $50 \%$ | $2 \%$ | $12 \%$ |  |  |  | $11 \%$ |
| 2.25 or less | $50 \%$ | $18 \%$ | $12 \%$ |  |  |  | $14 \%$ |
| Unknown | 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Grand Total | $10 \%$ | $16 \%$ | $13 \%$ | $15 \%$ | $5 \%$ | $19 \%$ | $17 \%$ |

[^4]
## Section 5: College Retention for Scholarship Non-Renewals



Fall-to-Fall Retention Rate for TELS First-time
Freshmen who Lost Scholarship Eligibility during Freshman Year by Scholarship Type, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010 *


* Data from 2009 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2010.


# One-year Retention Rate by Initial Qualifications 

 Met (HOPE and ASPIRE combined), TELS Firsttime Freshmen who Lost Scholarship Eligibility during Freshman Year, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010 *

* Data from 2009 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2010.

35
Tennessee Higher Education Commission

Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, One-year Retained TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010


Tennessee Higher Education Commission

# Median Family Adjusted Gross Income by Scholarship Type, One-year Non-retained TELS First-time Freshmen, Fall 2004 through Fall 2010 



## Questions?

## Report will be available at: <br> http://tn.gov/thec/Legislative/Reports.html under the "2012 Legislative Reports Section."

# A Comparison of States' Lottery Scholarship Programs 

## TENNESSEE HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION MEMBERS 2011-12

Ms. Sue Atkinson<br>Nashville - Davidson County<br>Mr. Charles W. Bone<br>Hendersonville - Sumner County<br>Gregory Alan Frye- University of Tennessee<br>Student (UTM)<br>Newbern - Gibson County<br>Mr. Tre Hargett, Secretary of State<br>Nashville - Davidson County<br>Ms. Sharon Hayes<br>Brownsville -Haywood County<br>Mr. Greg Isaacs<br>Knoxville - Knox County<br>Mr. Cato Johnson, Vice Chair<br>Bartlett - Shelby County<br>Mr. Jon Kinsey<br>Chattanooga - Hamilton County

Mr. David Lillard, Jr., State Treasurer
Nashville - Davidson County

Mr. Charles Mann, Vice Chair
Santa Fe -Maury County

Dr. Gary Nixon
Executive Director, State Board of Education
Nashville - Davidson County

Zack Walden - Tennessee Board of Regents
Student (ETSU)
LaFollette - Campbell County

Mr. A C Wharton, Secretary
Memphis- Shelby County

Mr. Robert White, Chair
Johnson City - Sullivan County

Mr. Justin Wilson, Comptroller
Nashville - Davidson County

## History

The Tennessee Higher Education Commission was created in 1967 by the Tennessee General Assembly (TCA 49-7-202) to achieve coordination and foster unity with regard to higher education. The Commission coordinates two systems of public higher education: the University of Tennessee institutions governed by the University of Tennessee Board of Trustees, and the state universities, community colleges, and technology centers governed by the Tennessee Board of Regents.

There are currently nine public universities, 13 community colleges, and 27 technology centers in Tennessee that serve over 256,500 students collectively. The Commission is composed of nine lay members appointed by the Governor for six year terms representing congressional districts of the State, three Constitutional Officers who are ex-officio voting members (Comptroller of the Treasury, State Treasurer, and Secretary of State), two ex-officio student members who serve two year terms, and the Executive Director of the State Board of Education as an ex-officio non-voting member.

## Mission

The mission for Tennessee's twenty-first century system of higher education is to elevate the overall educational attainment of citizens in the State through increased accessibility to mission-focused institutions, which deliver educational services on campus, as well as through a planned network of off-campus instruction and to prepare citizens responsibly for success in the new century by providing high quality teaching and research in an environment that serves the needs of its consumers.

## CONTENTS

Executive Summary ..... 5
Overview of State Lottery Scholarship Programs ..... 5
Policy Diffusion ..... 5
State Lottery Scholarship Program Eligibility Requirements ..... 10
Application Rules ..... 11
Initial Eligibility Requirements ..... 11
Core Course Requirements ..... 14
Scholarship Award Guidelines ..... 15
Award Details ..... 15
Remedial \& Summer Courses ..... 17
Renewal Requirements ..... 18
Restoration Rules ..... 18
Impacts on Access and Completion ..... 20
Impacts on Access ..... 20
Impacts on Completion ..... 22
Recent Policy Changes ..... 23
References ..... 25
Appendices ..... 27

## Executive Summary

Since the 1990s, seventeen states ${ }^{1}$ have enacted merit-based scholarship programs to broaden access to higher education and increase college completion rates by providing financial incentives to students who meet the scholarship requirements. The common goals of merit scholarships are often described as:

- To attract and retain the best and brightest students in the state;
- To widen opportunity for higher education by reducing students' financial burdens;
- To promote and reward academic achievement;
- To increase college enrollments and attainment rates; and
- To increase college completion and graduation rates.

In 2010 the Tennessee Higher Education Commission (THEC) conducted a comparison of state merit scholarship programs. Fourteen states were included in the comparison: Alaska, Florida, Georgia, Kentucky, Louisiana, Massachusetts, Michigan, Mississippi, Missouri, Nevada, New Mexico, South Carolina, West Virginia, and Tennessee. Each state uses various sources to fund the merit-aid scholarships. Some of them include tobacco settlement revenues, land leases and sales, turnpike revenues, state general funds, or state lottery revenues. Among them, eight states are using a state lottery to fund programs: Arkansas, Florida, Georgia, Kentucky, New Mexico, South Carolina, West Virginia, and Tennessee. The purpose of this report is to examine lottery funded merit-based scholarship programs in these eight states. Specifically, this report addresses questions about: 1.) How programs are similar or different regarding eligibility rules, award details, and renewal and restoration rules. 2.) What changes to the programs have occurred over time, and what was the impetus behind these changes (i.e. was it a policy decision, due to fiscal constraints, or both). 3.) Finally, to understand how the programs are related to college access and completion.

## Overview of State Lottery Scholarship Programs

## Policy Diffusion

Figure 1 shows the diffusion of lottery scholarship programs. With the exception of New Mexico's scholarship program, which was the second program created in 1996 and is uniquely structured, the growth of lottery scholarship programs has been heavily concentrated in the southeast region of the United States. The success of Georgia's program, which was the first program established in 1993, led its neighboring states to create their own programs in an

[^5]A Comparison of States' Lottery Scholarship Programs |
attempt to mirror Georgia's success. Evidence of Georgia' influence can be seen in the way the programs are structured, the naming of programs, and the legislative discussions surrounding the founding of states' programs. Like most policies that spread across states, the diffusion occurs incrementally. The growth in lottery scholarship programs has occurred over almost three decades, with four states implementing lottery scholarships in the 1990s, three in the 2000s, and Arkansas establishing its program most recently, in 2010.

Figure 1: Diffusion of Lottery Programs


Table 1 presents the lottery scholarship programs in each state. Four states, which are highlighted in blue, (Tennessee, Florida, Georgia, and South Carolina) have multiple programs or supplemental awards with differing rules. For the states with multiple programs, the largest and most common program is listed as the base program. More diverse program requirements result in more diverse students.

Table 1: Lottery Scholarship Programs in Each State

|  | Tennessee | Arkansas | Florida | Georgia | Kentucky | New Mexico | South Carolina | West <br> Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 4 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 1 |
| E 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 | TELS <br> Tennessee Education Lottery Scholarship | Academic Challenge | Bright <br> Futures <br> (FMS) <br> Florida <br> Medallion <br> Scholars <br> Award | HOPE <br> Helping Outstanding Pupils Educationally | KEES <br> Kentucky Educational Excellence Scholarship | Legislative Lottery Scholarship | LIFE <br> Legislative Incentives for Future Excellence | PROMISE <br> Providing Rea <br> Opportunities for Maximizing In-state Student Excellence |
|  | GAMS <br> HOPE with merit supplement |  | GSV <br> Gold Seal Vocational Scholars | Zell Miller |  |  | Palmetto Fellows |  |
|  | Access <br> Award |  | ATS <br> Academic Top Scholars |  |  |  | HOPE |  |
|  | ASPIRE <br> HOPE with need supplement |  | FAS <br> Florida Academic Scholars |  |  |  |  |  |

Table $\mathbf{2}$ and Table $\mathbf{3}$ present the year the program began, the number of students served and total costs in the most recent year, and the maximum and average award amounts across all lottery funded programs in the state. Florida served the largest number of students $(179,076)$ in the most recent year. Georgia and Florida have invested the most money with total costs of $\$ 539.9$ million and $\$ 423$ million in the 2010-2011 academic year. The average award amount among the eight states is $\$ 3,245$, but ranges from $\$ 1,500$ to $\$ 5,000$ per year at public 4 -year universities. As seen in Table 3, Tennessee, Florida, and South Carolina (highlighted in blue) have a different number of students served and total program costs when all programs are combined. Georgia's Zell Miller program did not begin until 2011; therefore, the number of Georgia's base program is the same as the total for all its programs, whose cells are marked in red. A more detailed overview of each state's lottery scholarship program can be found in Appendix A.

Table 2: Overview of State Lottery Scholarship Programs (Base Programs)

|  | Tennessee | Arkansas | Florida | Georgia | Kentucky | New Mexico | South Carolina | West <br> Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year Implemented | 2004 | 2010 | 1997 | 1993 | 1999 | 1996 | 1998 | 2002 |
| Number of students served in 2010-11 | 43,282 | 22,251 | 136,970 | 123,471 | 67,930 | 19,696 | 33,870 | 9,809 |
|  | \$ 148m | \$ 61m | \$ 290m | \$ 539.9m | \$ 93m | \$ 47m | \$ 164m | \$ 46m |
| Maximum Award | $\frac{\text { Prior to }}{\underline{2009}}$ $\$ 4,000$ (4-year) $\$ 2,000$ (2-year) $\frac{\text { After } 2009^{2}}{}{ }^{\$ 6,000}$ (4-year) $\$ 3,000$ (2-year) |  | \$2,385 ${ }^{3}$ |  | \$2,500 | Tuition Only | \$5,000 | \$5,406 ${ }^{6}$ |
| Average Award ${ }^{1}$ | \$3,430 | \$2,741 | \$2,124 | \$4,372 | \$1,369 | \$2,386 | \$4,842 | \$4,689 |
| Scholarships as a percent of average <br> Public 4-yr tuition \& fees ${ }^{5}$ | $\begin{gathered} 52.5 \% \\ (\$ 6,525) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 43.9 \% \\ (\$ 6,298) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 43.4 \% \\ (\$ 4,886) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 73.9 \% \\ (\$ 5,916) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 18.3 \% \\ (\$ 7,511) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 46.2 \% \\ (\$ 5,169) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 47.8 \% \\ (\$ 10,155) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 92.8 \% \\ (\$ 5,049) \end{gathered}$ |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ Average Award is a derived variable by THEC staff, using the number of students and total program costs in most recent year
${ }^{2}$ Divided equally over semesters including summer
${ }^{3}$ The award amount in Florida is per credit hour based and varies among different types of institutions http://www.floridastudentfinancialaid.org/SSFAD/bf/awardamt.htm
${ }^{4}$ The exact HOPE award amounts by institution can be found at http://www.gsfc.org/main/publishing/pdf/2011/hope award amounts.pdf
${ }^{5}$ The source for average public 4-year tuition and fees is The College Board, Trends in College Pricing (2011) http://professionals.collegeboard.com/data-reports-research/trends
${ }^{6}$ Students who were awarded PROMISE scholarship prior to January 1, 2010 receive an award equal to the actual tuition and mandatory fee charges. After January 1, 2010, the maximum award for students is $\$ 4,750$, or full tuition and fees, whichever is less.

Table 3: Overview of State Lottery Scholarship Programs (All Programs)

|  | Tennessee | Arkansas | Florida | Georgia | Kentucky | New Mexico | South Carolina | West <br> Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Number of students served in 2010-11 | 101,569 | 22,251 | 179,076 | 123,471 | 67,930 | 19,696 | 43,159 | 9,809 |
| Total program costs in 2010-11 | \$ 297m | \$ 61m | \$ 423m | \$ 539.9m | \$ 93m | \$ 47m | \$ 239m | \$ 46m |
| Maximum Award | $\frac{\text { Prior to }}{2009}$ <br> $\$ 4,000$ <br> (4-year) <br> $\$ 2,000$ <br> (2-year) <br> $\frac{\text { After 2009 }}{}{ }^{2}$ <br> $\$ 6,000$ <br> (4-year) <br> $\$ 3,000$ <br> (2-year) | $\frac{2010-11}{\$ 5,000}$ <br> (4-year) <br> $\$ 2,500$ <br> (2-year) <br> $\frac{2011-12}{}$ <br> $\$ 4,500$ <br> (4-year) <br> $\$ 2,250$ <br> (2-year) | \$2,385 ${ }^{3}$ |  | \$2,500 | Tuition Only | LIFE: <br> \$5.000 <br> Palmetto: <br> \$7,000 <br> HOPE: <br> \$2,800 | \$5,406 ${ }^{6}$ |
| Average Award ${ }^{1}$ | \$2,924 | \$2,741 | \$2,362 | \$4,372 | \$1,369 | \$2,386 | \$5,537 | \$4,689 |
| Scholarships as a percent of average Public 4-yr tuition $\&$ fees ${ }^{5}$ | $\begin{gathered} 44.8 \% \\ (\$ 6,525) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 43.9 \% \\ (\$ 6,298) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 48.3 \% \\ (\$ 4,886) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 73.9 \% \\ (\$ 5,916) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 18.3 \% \\ (\$ 7,511) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 46.2 \% \\ (\$ 5,169) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 54.5 \% \\ (\$ 10,155) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 98 \% \\ (\$ 5,049) \end{gathered}$ |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ Average Award is a derived variable by THEC staff, using the number of students and total program costs in most recent year
${ }^{2}$ Divided equally over semesters including summer
${ }^{3}$ The award amount in Florida is per credit hour based and varies among different types of institutions http://www.floridastudentfinancialaid.org/SSFAD/bf/awardamt.htm
${ }^{4}$ The exact HOPE award amounts by institution can be found at http://www.gsfc.org/main/publishing/pdf/2011/hope award amounts.pdf
${ }^{5}$ The source for average public 4-year tuition and fees is The College Board, Trends in College Pricing (2011) http://professionals.collegeboard.com/data-reports-research/trends
${ }^{6}$ Students who were awarded PROMISE scholarship prior to January 1, 2010 receive an award equal to the actual tuition and mandatory fee charges. After January 1, 2010, the maximum award for students is $\$ 4,750$, or full tuition and fees, whichever is less.

Figure 2 compares the average award amount of each state's base lottery program. Kentucky awards the least amount of money on average at $\$ 1,369$. West Virginia and South Carolina have the highest average award, $\$ 4,689$ and $\$ 4,855$ respectively. This comparison shows that the award amount varies across the eight states. The average award in Georgia and West Virginia covers more than 70 percent of tuition, while most states' average base award amount covers about half of the tuition cost. Tennessee's average award amount is $\$ 3,430$, which covers about 50 percent of tuition, and stands in the middle among the eight lottery scholarship states.

Figure 2: Amount of Average Award in Base Scholarship Program


## State Lottery Scholarship Program Eligibility Requirements

Each of the states analyzed requires students to meet minimum eligibility criteria, such as high school GPA, standardized test scores, high school core courses, or community service to receive a lottery scholarship award. The first part of this section illustrates the application rules and initial eligibility criteria for the base lottery scholarship program in each state. The second part explains the core course requirements in more detail.

## Application Rules

Five of the eight states require students to submit an application to participate in the scholarship program. Four of the five states allow the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) to serve as a student's application for the scholarship program, eliminating unnecessary duplication. West Virginia requires students to fill out a state application and a FAFSA. Florida recently changed its application from a state application to the FAFSA to ensure that its students were receiving federal student aid.

Table 4: Scholarship Application rules

|  | Tennessee | Arkansas | Florida | Georgia | Kentucky | New Mexico | South Carolina | West <br> Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Is application required? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | Yes |
| Application | FAFSA | FAFSA | FAFSA | FAFSA or State Application | - | - | - | FAFSA and State Application |
| Allows homeschooled students? | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| Allows Fulltime and Part-time students? | No | Yes (traditional students) No (Non- traditional students) | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes |

${ }^{1}$ New Mexico and West Virginia award scholarships to home-schooled students only if they pass the GED or attain a minimum GED score. (See Appendix D for more details on home-schooled students' eligibility criteria.)

## Initial Eligibility Requirements

As shown in Table 5, Florida and West Virginia are the states that require both an ACT score and a high school GPA for initial eligibility. While Georgia, Tennessee, Arkansas, and Kentucky require either an ACT score or a high school GPA. Among the eight states, five states (Florida's GSV and FMS, Georgia, South Carolina, West Virginia, and Tennessee) require a minimum 3.0 high school GPA for their base scholarship program. As discussed below, several states have supplemental awards or additional scholarship programs that require more rigorous academic scores, but also provide higher award amounts.

Table 5: Minimum Initial Eligibility Criteria for Base Lottery Scholarship Program ${ }^{1}$

|  | States that require both ACT/SAT and HSGPA |  | States that require either ACT/SAT or HSGPA |  |  |  | Other |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | FL | WV | GA | TN | AR | KY | NM | SC ${ }^{5}$ |
| High School <br> GPA | 3.0 | 3.0 | $3.0^{2}$ | 3.0 | 2.5 | 2.5 <br> (for base award) |  | 3.0 |
| ACT/SAT | 20 ACT | $\begin{gathered} 22 \mathrm{ACT} / \\ 1020 \text { SAT } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 85 \% \text { or } \\ \text { higher } \\ \text { on } \\ \text { SAT } \\ / \text { ACT }^{3} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 21 \\ \text { ACT/ } \\ 980 \\ \text { SAT } \end{gathered}$ | 19 | $\begin{gathered} \hline 15 \mathrm{ACT} / \\ 710 \mathrm{SAT} \\ \text { (for } \\ \text { bonus } \\ \text { award) } \end{gathered}$ |  | $\begin{gathered} 24 \\ \text { ACT/ } \\ 1100 \\ \text { SAT } \end{gathered}$ |
| Core Course <br> Requirements | Yes | Yes |  |  | Yes | Yes |  |  |
| College GPA |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.5 |  |
| High School Ranking |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Top } \\ & 30 \% \end{aligned}$ |
| Community Service | 75 hours required | 20 hours encouraged |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ For the minimum eligibility criteria for all programs in eight states, see Appendix B
${ }^{2}$ For graduates from a HOPE-eligible high school or home study program
${ }^{3}$ For graduates from an ineligible high school, home-study program or GED

For example, Georgia's Zell Miller, Florida Academic Scholars (FAS), and Tennessee’s General Assembly Merit Scholarship (GAMS) have higher requirements than their base programs. Georgia's HOPE scholarship recently changed its award amount from full tuition to a per-hour award at public institutions. However, the Zell Miller program, which requires a 3.7 GPA, awards full tuition to students attending public institutions or $\$ 2,000$ towards tuition for private
institutions. Florida has three different types of programs with varying eligibility criteria. The Florida Gold Seal Vocational Scholars (GSV) program requires a minimum 18 ACT score and 3.0 GPA; the Florida Medallion Scholars (FMS) requires a minimum 20 ACT score and 3.0 GPA; and the Florida Medallion Scholars Award (FAS) requires the highest GPA at 3.5 and a minimum of 100 hours of community service. ${ }^{2}$ However, FAS also awards up to $\$ 25$ more per credit hour than the other two programs. Tennessee's supplementary program, GAMS, requires a minimum 3.75 GPA and 29 ACT ( 1280 SAT), higher than the base HOPE requirements, however, students receive an additional supplement of $\$ 1,500$.

The minimum academic eligibility criteria in Kentucky and Arkansas are lower than other states. Students in Arkansas can receive the award with either a GPA of 2.5 or an ACT score of 19. On average, the states require a minimum GPA of 3.0 and an ACT score of at least 20. Contrary to its relatively lower academic requirements, the maximum award amount in Arkansas is similar to other states.

Kentucky's scholarship program awards different amounts according to students' academic achievement in high school. Students who earned a minimum 2.5 high school GPA would earn a base amount of $\$ 125$ for each year at college, and an additional $\$ 25$ for every 0.1 GPA point earned above the minimum. ${ }^{3}$ For instance, a high school student that earns a 3.0 GPA would get $\$ 250$ and with a 3.5 GPA they would receive $\$ 375$. In addition to this base award, students get another $\$ 35-\$ 36$ for every ACT point above the minimum score (15). The KEES program also provides supplemental awards for Advanced Placement (AP) or International Baccalaureate (IB). ${ }^{4}$ The AP/IB supplemental award is only for students who are eligible for free or reducedprice lunch during any year of high school and who have a qualifying score on an AP or IB exam.

New Mexico is the only state that bases scholarship eligibility entirely on collegiate performance. New Mexico requires students to complete 12 credit hours in their first semester in college with a 2.5 GPA to be eligible for the scholarship. If they meet the eligibility criteria, they can receive the scholarship for the next semester and receive a retroactive payment for their first semester. South Carolina has three eligibility categories: a high school GPA, ACT/SAT scores, or high school rankings. Students must meet at least two of the three requirements to be eligible for the scholarship.

The programs in Florida and West Virginia either require or encourage students to complete community service. Florida increased the number of hours required for community service for all three Bright Futures awards in 2011-2012. Now, students must complete 30(GSV), 75(FMA), and 100(FAS) hours to be eligible for the lottery scholarship awards. PROMISE scholarship applicants in West Virginia are strongly encouraged to complete at least 20 hours of unpaid

[^6]community service while in high school and college. Neither state verifies the community service hours worked by the student.

## Core Course Requirements

In addition to the eligibility criteria outlined above, Arkansas, Florida, Kentucky, and West Virginia require recipients to meet specific high school curriculum requirements. Table 6 provides a brief overview of the core subjects and the number of units or credits each state requires. Each number in the table reflects the number of units or credits students must complete to be eligible for the scholarship. However, when compared to the average high school graduation requirements, most of core course requirements are not higher than the states' high school graduation requirements except the blue colored states. Specifically, the math requirement in West Virginia and foreign language course requirements in Florida are higher than the high school graduation requirement.

Table 6: Core Courses Requirement

|  | Arkansas | Florida | Kentucky | West Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| English | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| Math | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 |
| Natural Science | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| Social Studies | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 |
| Arts | $1 / 2$ | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| Foreign Language | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| Health | $1 / 2$ | 0 | $1 / 2$ | 0 |
| Physical Education | $1 / 2$ | 0 | $1 / 2$ | 0 |
| Electives | Career(6) | 0 | 7 | 0 |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)

## Arkansas

To be eligible for an Academic Challenge award, Arkansas public high school students must successfully complete the "Smart Core Curriculum" (see Appendix C for more details) established by the Arkansas Department of Education. Graduates that do not complete the curriculum must achieve proficient or higher scores on all state-mandated end-of-course assessments, including Algebra I, Geometry and Biology.

## Florida

Florida requires students to complete 16 credit hours of college preparatory academic courses including English, math, social science, natural science, and foreign language.

## Kentucky

In Kentucky, students are eligible to receive the lottery scholarship award with a minimum 2.5 high school GPA for the basic award. If students have at least a 15 composite ACT score or 710 SAT score, they can receive a bonus award. However, students must meet the KEES authorized curriculum requirements and earn at least a 2.5 GPA in every year of high school. The KEES authorized curriculum requires 22 units in the following categories: language arts, math, science, social studies, health, physical education, arts appreciation, and electives.

## West Virginia

West Virginia's PROMISE program has both a minimum high school GPA and a minimum test score for basic eligibility. For the high school GPA requirements, students must graduate with at least a 3.0 GPA in both the core courses and overall coursework. All core classes listed by the College Foundation of West Virginia should be completed and used when calculating the core GPA. The core courses include: English, math, social studies, and science (for the detailed core subjects in each category, see Appendix C).

## Scholarship Award Guidelines

## Award Details

Table 7 presents the scholarship award details in eight states. This section summarizes the maximum award amount, the maximum number of years awarded, and the minimum credit requirements. Additionally, each state has different rules regarding the maximum length of time allowed between high school graduation, college enrollment, and credit hours.

Table 7: Award Details

|  | $\begin{array}{c}\text { Maximum Award } \\ \text { Amount }\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c}\text { Year- } \\ \text { Limit }\end{array}$ | Credit Hour Cap | $\begin{array}{c}\text { Enroll } \\ \text { Immediately } \\ \text { after H.S } \\ \text { graduation }\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{c}\text { Can Use } \\ \text { Scholarship } \\ \text { for Out-of- } \\ \text { State }\end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Enrollment |  |  |  |  |  |$]$

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ KEES gives initial award amounts based on the high school GPA the students earned each year with minimum high school GPA of 2.5. Beyond on that, students are awarded an ACT bonus (with ACT score of 15 or above) and AP/ IB supplement (with a qualifying score on an AP or IB exam).

Award amounts vary among the states. New Mexico awards the base cost of tuition excluding additional educational expenses. Arkansas, South Carolina, West Virginia, and Tennessee have similar award amount ranges, from $\$ 4,500$ to $\$ 6,000$ per year for full-time students enrolled in public 4-year institutions. Additionally, Florida, Kentucky, and Tennessee award different amounts of money according to the student's high school GPA or composite ACT scores.

Five states (Arkansas, Kentucky, New Mexico, South Carolina, and West Virginia) allow students to receive the scholarship for up to four years from high school graduation, while Tennessee and Florida allow up to five years or 120 semester hours. Four states (Arkansas, New Mexico, South Carolina, and West Virginia) require students to go full-time to receive the award, while Tennessee, Florida, Georgia, and Arkansas allow part-time students. Arkansas divides traditional and non-traditional students, allowing only non-traditional students (students not enrolling immediately after high school graduation) to be enrolled part-time. Non-traditional students are allowed to attend part-time with a minimum six semester hour completion. Arkansas requires traditional students, however, to complete 27-30 semester hours per year.

Tennessee (120) and Georgia (127) have cumulative semester hour caps on the award. Florida and New Mexico require students to complete at least 6-12 credit hours each semester, while West Virginia (27) and Arkansas (30) require students to complete a specific number of credit hours each year.

## Remedial \& Summer Courses

Of the eight states with lottery scholarship programs, half allow students to use their scholarship for remedial courses (Table 8). Additionally, half of the states allow students to utilize their lottery scholarship for the summer semester. Tennessee became the most recent state to allow students to allow lottery scholarships to apply towards summer enrollment in 2010.

Table 8: Remedial \& Summer Courses Funding

|  | TN | AR | FL | GA | KY | NM | SC | WV |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Funds <br> Remedial <br> Courses? | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | Yes |
| Funds <br> Summer <br> Courses? | Yes | No | Yes (only <br> with <br> available <br> funds) | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |

## Renewal Requirements

Every state included in this comparison requires students to maintain a minimum GPA level to renew the scholarship each year (see Table 9). The minimum renewal requirement ranges from 2.5 (Arkansas and New Mexico) to 2.75 (Tennessee, Florida and West Virginia), to 3.0 (Georgia, Florida, Kentucky, South Carolina, and West Virginia). In Florida, students must maintain at least a 2.75-3.00 GPA, depending on their program, and earn at least 6-12 semester hours according to their full-time or part-time status. In Kentucky, students must maintain a minimum 3.0 GPA to receive the full award amount. When students earn at least a 2.5 GPA but below a 3.0, the full award will only be renewed if they have completed enough hours for graduation. If they have not earned enough credit hours for successful graduation, the award amount will be reduced by 50 percent. In West Virginia, first year scholarship recipients must maintain an overall GPA of at least a 2.75 at the end of the first year. Thereafter, an overall GPA of 3.0 is required for renewal. Additionally, a student must earn a minimum of 30 credit hours a year for renewal.

Table 9: College GPA Renewal Requirements

|  | Tennessee | Arkansas | Florida $^{1}$ | Georgia | Kentucky | New <br> Mexico | South <br> Carolina | West <br> Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $1^{\text {st }}$ year | 2.75 | 2.50 | $2.75-$ <br> 3.00 | 3.00 | $3.0:$ Full | 2.50 | 3.00 | 2.75 |
| $2^{\text {nd }}$ year | 2.75 | 2.50 | $2.75-$ <br> 3.00 | 3.00 | $2.5: 50 \%$ | 2.50 | 3.00 | 3.00 |
| $3^{\text {rd }} \&$ | 3.00 | 2.50 | $2.75-$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| after | 3.00 | 3.00 | $2.5: 50 \%$ | 2.50 | 3.00 | 3.00 |  |  |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ FMS and GSV programs: 2.75 GPA, FAS program: 3.0 GPA

## Restoration Rules

Each state established rules for students who failed to renew the scholarship either because they did not meet the minimum GPA or they did not achieve the minimum credit requirements. Among the eight states, six states allow students to regain the scholarship at least one time. However, to restore the scholarship, students are required to meet either academic or credit hour requirements such as meeting certain GPA or completing certain credit hours. Table 10 illustrates the restoration rules of each state including the number of times a student can regain the award and detailed requirements.

Table 10: Restoration Rules

|  |  | TN | AR | FL | GA | KY | NM | SC | WV |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A stud scho | WS <br> nt to ain rship | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |
| Nu of | er <br> ces | One-time | One-time | One-time | Onetime |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | After meeting the renewal criteria 2.75 GPA \& attempting 24/48 semester hours <br> or <br> meeting 3.0 GPA after 72 hours | Completion of 30 semester hours per year with 2.5 GPA | After meeting 2.75 GPA renewal requirement | After attempting 60hrs.(sem ester) 90 hrs (quarter) with 3.0 GPA or After attempting 90 hrs . (semester) 135 hrs . (quarter) with 3.0 GPA | After meeting 2.5 GPA renewal requirement |  | After meeting 3.0 GPA renewal requirement |  |
|  |  |  |  | Not permitted ${ }^{1}$ |  |  |  | With <br> minimum 30 <br> credit hrs. <br> (rising <br> sophomore) <br> or <br> minimum 60 <br> credit hrs. <br> (rising junior) <br> or <br> minimum 90 <br> credit hrs. <br> (rising <br> senior) |  |

Source: State program websites and state finance annual report (Citations can be found in References)
${ }^{1}$ A student who fails to meet the minimum earned hour requirement in any academic year renewal period will not be permitted a restoration opportunity.

## Impacts on Access and Completion

Each state is making efforts for students to have better access to higher education and to successfully complete. This section examines each state's program in terms of incentives for student access and completion.

## Impacts on Access

Figure $\mathbf{3}$ compares the number of students served in the most recent year in each state's base lottery scholarship program. West Virginia serves the fewest number of students $(9,809)$ and Florida the most $(136,970)$.

Figure 3: Number of Students Served in the Base Program in the Most Recent Year and Total Base Program Costs in 2010-11, in Millions


Figure 4:

## Continuum of State Lottery Scholarship Programs based on Academic Eligibility (Composite ACT score and high school GPA) and Financial-Need Requirements

```
Least Stringent Eligibility Criteria
```


## Most Stringent <br> Eligibility Criteria



Figure 4 depicts a continuum of states' lottery scholarship programs based on their composite ACT and high school GPA eligibility requirements. ${ }^{5}$ The continuum shows there is wide variation in eligibility criteria both between and within state lottery programs. For example, New Mexico's program does not require high school graduates to have a minimum high school GPA or composite ACT score to be eligible ${ }^{6}$ while Kentucky's ( 2.5 GPA or 15 ACT) and Arkansas's ( 2.5 GPA or 19 ACT) eligibility requirements are the lowest among the states with minimum high school GPA or/and ACT score requirements. Tennessee, Florida, Georgia, and South Carolina have multiple lottery scholarship programs, reflecting their efforts to serve students with differing academic abilities and financial needs. ${ }^{7}$

As was previously discussed, wide variations exist in the number of students participating in each program, with programs focused on students with demonstrated financial need typically having smaller enrollments than the base programs. Research has shown that using traditional measures, such as high school GPA and standardized test scores, results in students who were likely to attend college even without the public financial assistance receiving a disproportionate number of awards. Among the eight lottery programs, only Tennessee's ASPIRE and ACCESS programs include demonstrated financial need as one of the eligibility criteria.

[^7]
## Impacts on Completion

Several components of each state's lottery scholarship programs reflect their efforts to increase degree and certificate completion. For example, four states (Arkansas, Florida, Kentucky, and West Virginia) currently require core courses in addition to minimum academic eligibility. By encouraging students to complete certain subjects and credits, students will be better prepared academically, increasing the likelihood of completion. Second, the academic eligibility criteria such as high school GPA and ACT score, are screening tools to make sure that students are academically prepared to be successful in college. Third, the renewal criteria and credit cap requirements incentivize students to take an adequate number of credits each semester to graduate within four to five years. In addition to the renewal criteria, six states among the eight lottery states studied allow students the opportunity to regain the scholarship if they meet certain academic requirements or credit/hour requirements. This restoration rule might prevent students who lost the scholarship from dropping out of college. More details on completion related initiatives in each state are discussed below.

## Tennessee

Among the Fall 2004 cohort of students who received TELS, 55 percent graduated within 6years compared to 44 percent for 2004 first-time freshmen (FTF) at Tennessee public institutions in that same time period. The graduation rate was 52.5 percent among Tennessee Board of Regents (TBR) universities, 39.2 percent among TBR community colleges, 65.1 percent among University of Tennessee (UT) campuses, and 67.5 percent among Tennessee Independent Colleges and Universities (TICUA) institutions.

## Georgia

There is a growing body of research about the impact of receiving a HOPE scholarship and college completion. Henry and Rubenstein (2004) found several differences between Georgia's HOPE recipients and non-recipients. HOPE recipients earned an average of almost 14 credit hours more during 4 years than did non-recipients. They also achieved a college GPA that was .17 points higher on a 4-point scale. A significant difference in graduation rate was also found at both 2 -year and 4 -year institutions: HOPE recipients' graduation rates were almost twice as high as non-recipients at 2-year colleges and 72 percent higher at 4 -year institutions. African Americans, other minority groups, and females were found to be less likely to have persisted than other students. The Georgia Board of Regents (2001) reported that for fall 1994 freshman, 70 percent of HOPE recipients lost their scholarships after attempting 30 credit hours, and only 13 percent kept it for 4 years.

## New Mexico

New Mexico's 2010 annual report indicates that since its inception more than 61,251 students have received a scholarship, and 25,430 lottery scholarship recipients have graduated, a 41.5 percent graduation rate. New Mexico's program uses first year college GPA as its initial criterion and the renewal requirements are lower than other states, including Tennessee.

## West Virginia

West Virginia reports that both retention of the scholarship and percentage of PROMISE scholars earning their associate's or bachelor's degree within four years has increased. PROMISE scholars' graduation and transfer rates have been consistently higher than those of the general student body, which would be expected given their higher academic credentials. The five-year graduation rates of PROMISE scholars have risen from 61.4 to 63.5 percent from 2003 to 2005. This compares favorably with the 41 to 43 percent range for all students during those three years. West Virginia's initial eligibility requirements are almost the same as Tennessee's, except that West Virginia requires both high school GPA and ACT score. The credit caps are also similar to Tennessee, in that West Virginia requires 120 cumulative semester hours and 30 credit hours each semester.

Scott-Clayton (2008) investigated how West Virginia's PROMISE scholarship program affected student outcomes. According to the findings, five-year graduation rates have increased by 3.7 percentage points among PROMISE recipients and four-year graduation rates by 6.7 percentage points. On average, senior students earned an additional 6 credits and were 11 percentage points more likely to have completed the minimum 120 credits required for graduation than students not receiving a PROMISE scholarship. These positive effects are mainly related to the program's criteria for renewal; a minimum of 30 credit hours must be obtained each year of enrollment. The course-load requirement gives students more incentives to finish college in four years. According to the author, "incentives based on clear, short-term goals and linked to salient near-term reward may help students overcome procrastination and choice paralysis" (Scott-Clayton, 2008). This suggests that small changes in designing financial incentives may alter students' outcomes tremendously.

## Recent Policy Changes

This section summarizes key policy changes recently made by each state.

- Beginning fall 2011, Georgia reduced its award amount from full-tuition and fees and book allowance to up to $90 \%$ of tuition and fees. Both Georgia's HOPE and Zell Miller program eliminated book and fee allowances. These reductions are primarily due to increases in demand and lottery fund shortages.
- Since 2009, Florida reduced scholarships (uncoupled with tuition, used to pay full tuition and fees), raised eligibility criteria, and reduced the award limit from five years to four years.
- West Virginia also reduced the award amount from full-tuition and fees to $\$ 4,750$ or full tuition \& fees, whichever is less due to increased expenditures since 2009.
- New Mexico is considering increasing GPA requirements due to flat revenue and casino competition in 2012.
- Tennessee's lottery program allowed summer courses and put a five year limit for award.


## References

Arkansas Higher Education Coordinating Board. (2011, October). Arkansas Academic Challenge Scholarship Rules and Regulations. Arkansas Financial Aid Programs. Retrieved from http://www.adhe.edu/divisions/financialaid/Pages/fa_programs.aspx

Arkansas Department of Higher Education. (2011, December). Arkansas Higher Education Comprehensive Annual Report . Retrieved from http://www.adhe.edu/SiteCollectionDocuments/Comprehensive\ Report/2011/03\% 20-\%20Miscellaneous\%20Legislative\%20Reports\%20FY11.pdf

College Foundation of West Virginia. (2012). West Virginia PROMISE scholarship. CFWV website. Retrieved from
https://secure.cfwv.com/Financial Aid Planning/Scholarships/Scholarships and Grant s/WestVirginia PROMISE.aspx

Florida Department of Education. (2010, October). Office of Student Financial Assistance:
Annual report to the commissioner 2009-10. Retrieved from http://www.floridastudentfinancialaid.org/SSFAD/home/StateProgramLinks.htm

Florida Department of Education. (2011, September). Office of Student Financial Assistance:
End-of-Year report 2010-11. Retrieved from
https://www.floridastudentfinancialaidsg.org/pdf/EOY Reports/2010-
11/BF 2010 2011.pdf
Florida Department of Education. (2012). Florida Bright Futures Scholarship program. Florida student grant \& scholarship programs. Retrieved from http://www.floridastudentfinancialaid.org/SSFAD/bf/

Georgia Student Finance Commission. (2012). Zell Miller scholarship program overview. GA College 411. Retrieved from https://secure.gacollege411.org/Financial Aid Planning/Scholarships/Zell Miller Scho larship/Zell Miller Scholarship Program Overview.aspx

Georgia Student Finance Commission. (2012). HOPE scholarship program overview. GA College 411. Retrieved from https://secure.gacollege411.org/Financial_Aid_Planning/HOPE_Program/Georgia_s_H OPE_Scholarship_Program_Overview.aspx

Henry, G. T., Rubenstein, R., \& Bugler, D. T. (2004). Is HOPE Enough? Impacts of Receiving and Losing Merit-Based Financial Aid. Educational Policy, 18(5), 686-709.

Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority. (May, 2009). 2008 Kentucky Educational Excellence Scholarship Data Report. KHEAA website. Retrieved from http://www.kheaa.com/pdf/reports/kees 2008.pdf

A Comparison of States' Lottery Scholarship Programs | 25

Kentucky Higher Education Assistance Authority. (2012). Kentucky Educational Excellence Scholarship Program. KHEAA website. Retrieved from http://www.kheaa.com/website/kheaa/kees?main=1

Kentucky Higher Education Department. (2010). 2010 Annual Report. KHEAA website. Retrieved from http://www.kheaa.com/pdf/annual 2010.pdf
K. Woodfaulk \& Director of Student Services Division. (June, 2011). South Carolina Commission on Higher Education Memorandum to directors of Financial Aid. Columbia, South Carolina.
M. Downey. (2011). HOPE Lite versus Full HOPE: Less filling but more lasting? AJC Get Schooled blog

New Mexico Higher Education Department. (2010). Helping students succeed: Annual Report 2010. Santa Fe, New Mexico.

New Mexico Higher Education Department. (2012). Financial aid \& scholarship introduction. New Mexico financial aid website. Retrieved from http://hed.state.nm.us/FinAid.aspx

Scott-Clayton, J. (2008). On Money and Motivation: A Quasi-Experimental Analysis of Financial Incentives for College Achievement. Dissertation. Kennedy School of Government. Harvard University. Cambridge, MA.

Southern Regional Education Board (2011). 2011 Final Legislative Report via www.sreb.org
South Carolina Commission on Higher Education. (2011). South Carolina higher education statistical abstract. South Carolina Commission on Higher Education division of finance. Retrieved from www.che.sc.gov/Finance/Stat.htm

West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission \& Community and Technical College System. (2010). Financial Aid Comprehensive Report 2010. Retrieved from http://wvhepcnew.wvnet.edu/

West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission. (2012). West Virginia financial aid programs. Retrieved from http://wvhepcnew.wvnet.edu/

## Appendices

## Appendix A: Detailed Overview of Lottery Programs by State

## Tennessee

Tennessee began its lottery scholarship program (TELS) in 2004. Since its inception, it has served 425,014 students at a total cost of $\$ 1.19$ billion. In academic year 2010-11, it served 101,569 students with total expenditures of $\$ 297$ million. The maximum award amount is $\$ 6,000$ at 4 -year institutions and $\$ 3,000$ at 2 -year institutions. The award amount is divided equally over three semesters; therefore, a student that does not enroll in summer classes receives a maximum award amount of $\$ 4,000$ at a $4-\mathrm{yr}$ institution and $\$ 2,000$ at a $2-\mathrm{yr}$.

## Arkansas

Arkansas began its lottery scholarship program in 2010. It served 12,444 traditional students (students that enroll immediately following their high school graduation), 4,865 currentachiever students (students currently enrolled in college or enrolling in college for the first time), and 3,600 non-traditional students (students re-enrolling after a period of time) at a total cost of $\$ 87.9$ million in 2010. From the academic year 2011-2012, award amounts were $\$ 4,500$ for students attending 4-year institutions, \$2,250 for students attending 2-year institutions divided equally over fall and spring semesters.

## Florida

Florida's Bright Futures scholarship program started in 1997. It served 177,612 students with a cost of $\$ 437$ million in 2010-11. The average scholarship amount was $\$ 2,385$. The recipients are awarded different amounts according to the type of institution they attend.

## Georgia

Georgia was the first state to implement a lottery scholarship program. Since its inception in 1993, the HOPE scholarship has funded 507,285 students at a cost of $\$ 2.35$ billion. In 2010-11, the HOPE scholarship was awarded to 123,471 eligible high school graduates at a total cost of $\$ 539.9$ million. The total award amount is $\$ 70-\$ 210$ per-hour at public institutions. Full-time students attending private colleges or universities receive $\$ 1,800$ per semester.

## Kentucky

Kentucky's Educational Excellence Scholarship (KEES) began in 1999. Since its inception, KEES awarded a total of $\$ 541,843,290$ to eligible students. In 2010, KEES awarded $\$ 93$ million to 67,930 students. The maximum award amount is $\$ 2,500$ and the average is $\$ 1,369$.

## New Mexico

New Mexico's legislative lottery scholarship awarded about \$47 million to 19,696 students in 2010. Since its inception in 1996, 61,251 students have been awarded $\$ 330$ million in scholarships. The scholarship program awards full tuition and does not include fees.

## Appendix A: Detailed Overview of Lottery Programs by State

## South Carolina

South Carolina began its lottery scholarship program in 1998. It served 33,851 students at a cost of $\$ 164$ million in 2010. Students that meet at least two of the eligibility criteria receive up to \$5,000 annually.

## West Virginia

West Virginia's PROMISE scholarship awards eligible high school graduates an average of $\$ 4,553$ to cover the cost of tuition and mandatory fees at public or independent institutions in West Virginia. The PROMISE program began in 2002. In academic year 2008-09, it provided for 9,333 students at a total cost of $\$ 45$ million.

Appendix B: Minimum eligibility criteria for all programs in eight states

|  | States that require both ACT/SAT and HSGPA |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | States that require either <br> ACT/SAT or HSGPA |  |  |  |  | Other |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Florida |  |  |  | $\frac{\text { Georgia }}{\text { Zell Miller }}$ |  | Tennessee |  | West Virginia | Georgia <br> HOPE | TN |  | AK | KY | NM | South Carolina |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 认 | $\sum_{i}^{n}$ | $\frac{\square}{8}$ | y | Eligible HS | Ineligibl e HS | GAMS | ACCESS |  |  | HOPE | ASPIRE |  |  |  |  | 쁠 |  |
|  | 3.0 |  |  | 3.5 | 3.7 |  | 3.75 | 2.75 | 3.0 | 3.0 | 3.0 | 3.0 | 2.5 | 2.5 |  | $\begin{gathered} 3.5 \\ (4.0) \end{gathered}$ | 3.0 | 3.0 |
| 岩 | $\stackrel{\circ}{\circ}$ | 20/980 |  | $\underset{\sim}{\underset{\sim}{\sim}}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 26 / \\ & 1200 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 26 / \\ 1200 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 29 / \\ 1280 \end{gathered}$ | 18-20 | $\begin{gathered} 22 / \\ 1020 \end{gathered}$ | $85 \%$ or higher on SAT /ACT | $\begin{aligned} & 21 / \\ & 980 \end{aligned}$ | 21/980 | 19 | 15/710 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 27 / \\ & 1200 \\ & (32 / \\ & 1400) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 24 / \\ 1100 \end{gathered}$ |  |
|  | Yes | Yes |  | Yes |  |  |  |  | Yes |  |  |  | Yes | Yes |  |  |  |  |
| ¢ |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \hline 3.3 \\ (30 \mathrm{sem} . \\ \text { Hours) } \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.5 |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6\% | 30\% |  |

A Comparison of States' Lottery Scholarship Programs | 30

Appendix B: Minimum eligibility criteria for all programs in eight states


## Appendix C: Core Curriculum Requirements in Each State

## C-1: Arkansas: Smart Core Course Curriculum

| Category | Course | Unit |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| English <br> (4 Units) | $9^{\text {th }}$ Grade English | 1 |
|  | $10^{\text {th }}$ Grade English | 1 |
|  | $11^{\text {th }}$ Grade English | 1 |
|  | $12^{\text {th }}$ Grade English | 1 |
| Oral Communications (1⁄2 Unit) |  | $1 / 2$ |
| Natural Science (3 Units) | Biology | 1 |
|  | Physical Science, Chemistry, Physics | 2 units from the three options |
| Mathematics <br> (4 Units) <br> One unit must be taken at 11th or 12th grade | Algebra I | 1 |
|  | Geometry | 1 |
|  | Algebra II | 1 |
|  | Beyond Algebra II | 1 |
| Social Studies (3 Units) | Civics/American Government | 1 |
|  | World History | 1 |
|  | American History | 1 |
| Fine Arts |  | 1/2 |
| Health and Safety |  | $1 / 2$ |
| Physical Education |  | 1/2 |
| Career Focus |  | 6 |

## Appendix C: Core Curriculum Requirements in Each State

## C-2: Florida

- 4 English (3 with substantial writing)
- 4 Mathematics (Algebra I level and above)
- 3 Natural Science (2 with substantial lab)
- 3 Social Science
- 2 Foreign Language (sequential, in the same language)


## C-3: Kentucky

- Language Arts - 4 units
- Mathematics - 3 units
- Science - 3 units
- Social Studies - 3 units
- Health $-1 / 2$ unit
- Physical Education $-1 / 2$ unit
- Arts Appreciation - 1 unit
- Electives - 7 units


## C-4: West Virginia

- 4 English Credits:

AP English, International English Language

- 4 Math Credits:

Algebra I, II, III, Geometry, Conceptual Math, Trigonometry, Probability and Statistics, Pre- Calculus, Calculus, Integrated Math

- 4 Social Studies Credits:

US History, World History, 20th-21st Century History, Civics/ Government

- 3 Science Credits:

Physical Science, Biology, Chemistry, Physics, Earth Science, human Anatomy and Physiology, Botany, Zoology

|  | Florida | Georgia | Kentucky | New <br> Mexico | South Carolina | West Virginia |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Accreditation |  | Program accredited by accrediting agencies ${ }^{8}$ |  |  | Information must be provided by the approved home school association |  |
| Academic Requirements | $\begin{aligned} & 1070 \text { SAT or } \\ & 23 \mathrm{ACT} \\ & \text { (FMS) } \end{aligned}$ | HOPE-eligible home study program: 3.00 GPA ${ }^{9}$ average on all core coursework <br> Ineligible program: 85\% or higher on SAT/ACT | ACT composite score of 15 or better (SAT score of 710 or better) on a national exam | Must pass New Mexico GED \& meet all eligibility criteria | GPA 3.0, 24 <br> ACT /1100SAT <br> High school rankings top 30\% <br> (meeting 2 of 3) | For GED/homeschooled students: <br> A minimum score of 2500 on the GED for scholarship consideration |
| Other | Document a Collegepreparatory curriculum | An official transcript and documentation must be sent (information on its accreditation, grading scale, and course or GPA weighting |  |  | The GPA and class rank requirements must be based on the SC Uniform Grading Policy(UGP) |  |

*The states with green cells have the same eligibility criteria with high school graduates (South Carolina require the GPA score and rankings of home-schooled students must be based on UGP)
*The
states with red cells have different eligibility criteria with high school graduates (FMS: 3.0 GPA and 20 ACT)

[^8]Appendix E: South Carolina Lottery Scholarship Requirements
South Carolina Lottery Scholarship Requirements

| $\begin{gathered} \text { ACT } \\ \text { Composite } \end{gathered}$ |  | 11 | 13 | 1 | 14 | 16 | 19 | 21 | 24 |  |  | 29 | 32 | 33 | 36 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SAT (CR + M) | 400 | 50 | 60 |  |  | 800 | 900 | 100 | 110 |  |  | 1300 | 1400 | 1500 | 1600 |
| Top 6\% ( $\mathbf{3} .5$ minimum) | L | L | L | L |  | L | L | L | L |  |  | P | P | P | P |
| 4.00 | L | L | L | L |  | L | L | L | L |  |  | L | P | P | P |
| Top 30\% (3.0 min) | L | L | L | L |  | L | L | L | L |  |  | L | L | L | L |
| 3.00 | H | H | H |  |  | H | H | H | L |  |  | L | L | L | L |
| Less than 3.0 | X | X | X |  |  | X | X | X | X |  |  | X | X | X | X |
| Not <br> Qualified$\quad$HOPE <br> Scholarship |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Source: http://www.slideshare.net/joverton/south-carolina-lottery-scholarship-requirements

Appendix F: Merit-based scholarship programs currently implemented in all states (lottery \& non-lottery funded)



[^0]:    * Data from 2005 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2006.

[^1]:    * Data from 2005 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2006.

[^2]:    * Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.

[^3]:    * Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.

[^4]:    * Data from 2004 were used for ETSU and NSCC instead of 2005.

[^5]:    ${ }^{1}$ Alaska(1999), Arkansas(1991, 2009), Florida(1997), Georgia(1993), Kentucky(1999), Louisiana(1998), Massachusetts (2006), Maryland(2002), Michigan(2000), Mississippi(1996), Missouri(1997), Nevada(2000), New Mexico(1997), Oklahoma, South Carolina(1998), Tennessee(2003, 2004), West Virginia(2002, 2005)

[^6]:    ${ }^{2}$ Community service hours re not verified by the program office.
    ${ }^{3}$ The detailed information about KEES award amounts can be found at http://www.kheaa.com/website/kheaa/keesaward?main=1
    ${ }^{4}$ KEES gives initial award amounts of money based on the GPA the students earned each year with minimum GPA of 2.5. Beyond on that, students are awarded ACT bonus (with ACT score of 15 or above) and AP/ IB supplement (with a qualifying score on an AP or IB exam).

[^7]:    ${ }^{5}$ The intent of the figure is to show how programs rank, not the relative distance between program requirements.
    ${ }^{6}$ New Mexico's high school graduates enrolling in college immediately after graduation are eligible for the scholarship; however, students only receive the scholarship if they completed 12 credit hours in their first semester with a 3.0 GPA. Recipients then receive a retroactive payment for the first semester and funding for their second semester.
    ${ }^{7}$ It is important to note that there is large variation in the enrollment of these programs.

[^8]:    ${ }^{8}$ If the high school or home study program is located in the state of Georgia:
    Southern Association of Colleges and Schools; Georgia Accrediting Commission; Georgia Association of Christian Schools; Association of Christian Schools International; Georgia Private School Accreditation Council; or Association of Christian Schools International; Georgia Private School Accreditation Council; or Southern Association of Independent Colleges.

    ## If the high school or home study program is located outside the state of Georgia:

    Southern Association of Colleges and Schools; New England Association of Colleges and Schools; Middle States Association of Colleges and Schools; North Central Association of Colleges and Schools; Northwest Accreditation Commission; Western Association of Schools and Colleges; or Alabama Independent School Association.
    ${ }^{9}$ The grade point average calculation must be based on unique HOPE Scholarship calculation. How the HOPE Scholarship GPA calculated can be found athttps://secure.gacollege411.org/images/ga/pdfs/HOPE Calculation.pdf

